

# NANDAKOVĀDA NANDAKA'S ADVICE

TRANSLATED BY  
ĀNANDAJOTI BHIKKHU



## **Table of Contents**

Texts

Introduction

### **Nandaka's Advice**

Introduction

The Instruction on the Internal Sense Spheres

The Instruction on the External Sense Spheres

The Instruction on the Six Consciousnesses

The Oil Lamp Simile

The Big Tree Simile

The Cow Simile

The Key to the Cow Simile

The Factors of Awakening

The Fortunate One's Response

The Following Day

The Instruction on the Internal Sense Spheres

The Instruction on the External Sense Spheres

The Instruction on the Six Consciousnesses

The Oil Lamp Simile

The Big Tree Simile

The Cow Simile

The Key to the Cow Simile

The Factors of Awakening

The Fortunate One's Response

### **The Story about the Elder Nandaka**

His Aspiration and Good Deeds

His Last Life

His Past Life

Teaching the Nuns

## Texts

**BJT:** Sri Lankan edition, from the Buddha Jayanti Tripitaka Series, Volume XII (Colombo, 1974/2517, reprinted with corrections 2005).

**PTS:** European edition, Majjhima-nikāya, Vol. III, (London 1899, reprinted London, 1951). Heavily abbreviated, over and above the normal peyyāla passages, often without notice.

**RTE:** Royal Thai edition, as found on Budsir for Windows CD-ROM (version 2.0, Bangkok, 1996). This edition is the most problematic in its readings.

**ChS:** Burmese edition as found on the Chaṭṭha Saṅgāyana CD-ROM (version 3, Igatpuri, no date but = 1999). Has all the normal problems associated with the Burmese texts, like spelling differences. Used for both texts and commentaries.

**SHB:** Sri Lankan edition of the Aṅguttara Commentary,<sup>1</sup> from the Simon Hewavitarne Bequest series, Vol XV. Colombo 1923, reprinted Colombo 2007.

**MLD:** Middle Length Discourses of the Buddha, translated by Bhikkhu Ñāṇamoli and Bhikkhu Bodhi (2nd edition, Wisdom Publications, Somerville, 2001). The translation of this discourse takes up a mere 6 pages, and omits the repetition, which all the Eastern editions include in full.

There are quite a lot of variant readings in this text, most of which are trivial, being variant spellings or forms, etc. but some of which are important for a correct understanding of the text. Some of the more trivial variants, like writing class nasal or niggahīta, and the alternations between *l/l̄ t/t̄* and *n/n̄* I have ignored, in order to concentrate on true variations in reading.

With other readings, in line with my more recent practice on this site, I have tried to explain what the difference is between the form chosen and the variant, which is usually an alternative form, spelling or sandhi type. This will at least give some guidance as to why the reading has been chosen.

In what follows I have employed the following colour-coding:

**Text**

Translation

**Repetition Text (omitted in the editions)**

Repetition Translation

**Commentary**

Translation

---

<sup>1</sup> The Majjhima Commentary from the same series was not available to me at this time

## Introduction

This is an important discourse from the Majjhimanikāya in which the Buddha asks one of his senior disciples to give a teaching to the five-hundred nuns who went forth with Mahāpajāpatī Gotamī at their head, at the conclusion of which they all attained at least the level of Stream-Entry.

I have also translated two full commentaries connected to this discourse, the one on the discourse itself (MA), which I have interleaved with the discourse; and, in the Appendix, the story of Nandaka's life as related in the Aṅguttara commentary (AA) on the Foremost Disciples.

The discourse records that the monk who gave the teaching, Nandaka, was initially reluctant to give a teaching to the nuns, but it gives no reason for his reluctance. The commentary explains that the group of nuns had been his wives in a previous existence and he thought if someone with knowledge of previous lives saw him teach them they might think he was still attached to them, so he would send another monk in his place.

However, when the Buddha asks him personally to teach he agrees to do so, and gives a teaching on the non-self nature of the internal and external sense spheres and the consciousness that arises dependent on them; which is followed by two similes that illustrate the dependent nature of all things in existence, one about an oil lamp and the other about the shadow of a tree.

That in turn is followed by a simile of a butchered cow, which shows that when attachments have been severed by wisdom, they cannot be reunited with their object again, anymore than the cow can be resuscitated once it has been slaughtered and cut apart.

Following each of these teachings, Nandaka asks if the nuns have understood the teaching, and each time they agree that formerly they had seen the truth and were aware of their significance.

Nandaka then gives a summary teaching on the seven factors of Awakening, which is apparently the only teaching new to them. At the conclusion, the nuns approach the Buddha, who understands that, although they had benefited from the teaching, their aspirations had not been fulfilled.

The Buddha therefore asks Nandaka to give the exact same teaching on the following night, and at the conclusion of that teaching, all of them attained Path and Fruit at least to the level of Stream Level, which is confirmed by the Buddha himself.

This summary is according to the discourse and its explanation as given in the Majjhima commentary. Curiously, the commentary to the Aṅguttara disagrees in certain crucial aspects of the story, and I give here a summary of some of the main differences that are found:

In the discourse, it is said that the nuns were left unfulfilled by the first teaching, and there is no indication that they had reached any level of attainment, but AA states that

they attained Stream-Entry during this first teaching, and furthermore that they reported this to the Buddha, another matter which is entirely absent from the discourse.

In a similar way, in the discourse, at the conclusion of the second teaching the nuns attain at least Stream-Entry, but in AA they are said to have all attained complete Liberation (*Arahatta*).

There is another smaller discrepancy: at the conclusion of the teaching in the discourse it says that the nuns approached the Buddha, but in AA it says the Buddha approached the nuns.

As according to tradition the commentaries are both said to have been compiled by Bhadanta Buddhaghosa, it is hard to understand how such disagreements could have been left to stand. The Majjhima commentary draws on the Aṅguttara commentary almost verbatim for its story of both Mahāpajāpatī Gotamī together with the nuns, and Nandaka's own story, so he must have been aware of the discrepancies, but has allowed them to stand, and not attempted to harmonise them, which after all, would not have been very hard to do.

In any case, as the teaching was so successful, at a later date the Buddha named Nandaka as the foremost of his monk disciples in teaching the nuns, and he has held a special position with the nuns because of that ever since.

One thing that I have long suspected I managed to confirm in making this translation: it seems that the nuns are largely absent in the discourses and that the Buddha nearly always addressed himself to the monks (*bhikkhu*).

Here, however, when Ven Nandaka addresses the nuns he says:

**Satta kho ime, bhaginiyo, Bojjhaṅgā, yesaṃ bhāvitattā bahulikatattā, bhikkhu āsavānaṃ khayā, anāsavaṃ, cetovimuttiṃ paññāvimuttiṃ, diṭṭheva dhamme sayam abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja viharati.**

There are these seven Factors of Awakening, sisters, which when developed and made much of, a *bhikkhu*, through the destruction of the pollutants, without pollutants, freed in mind, freed through wisdom, dwells having known, having directly experienced, and having attained (Nibbāna) himself in this very life.

here the word *bhikkhu* must include the nuns he is addressing and encouraging with the Dhamma talk, therefore I have now now come to the conclusion that when *bhikkhu* is said in the discourses it should be taken as referring to both male and female renunciants, and that a more appropriate term for translation than *monk* would be *monastic*, unless we specifically know that the nuns are absent (something which does happen sometimes, including in this discourse).

Ānandajoti Bhikkhu  
August 2014

**Nandakovāda**  
Nandaka's Advice  
(MN 146 & MA)

**Introduction**

**Evam me sutam:**

Thus I have heard:

**'Evam me sutan'-ti Nandakovādasuttam.**

'Thus I have heard', this is the Discourse giving Nandaka's Advice.

**ekam samayaṃ Bhagavā Sāvatthiyaṃ viharati**

at one time the Fortunate One was dwelling near Sāvattthī

**Jetavane Anāthapiṇḍikassa ārāme.**

at Anāthapiṇḍika's grounds in Jeta's Wood.

**Atha kho Mahāpajāpatī Gotamī<sup>2</sup> pañcamattehi bhikkhunīsatehi saddhim**

Then Mahāpajāpatī Gotamī together with at least five hundred nuns

**yena Bhagavā tenupasaṅkami,**

approached the Fortunate One,

**upasaṅkamitvā Bhagavantam abhivādetvā ekam-antam aṭṭhāsi.**

and after approaching and worshipping the Fortunate One, she stood on one side.

**Ekam-antam ṭhitā kho Mahāpajāpatī Gotamī Bhagavantam etad-avoca:**

While standing on one side Mahāpajāpatī Gotamī said this to the Fortunate One:

**“Ovadamu, Bhante, Bhagavā bhikkhuniyo,**

“The Fortunate One should advise the nuns, reverend Sir,

**anusāsatu, Bhante, Bhagavā bhikkhuniyo,**

the Fortunate One should instruct the nuns, reverend Sir,

**karotu, Bhante, Bhagavā bhikkhunīnaṃ Dhammiṃ kathan.”-ti<sup>3</sup>**

the Fortunate One should give a Dhamma talk to the nuns, reverend Sir.”

<sup>2</sup> ChS: *Mahāpajāpatigotamī*, and similarly elsewhere; compound form.

<sup>3</sup> RTE, PTS: *Dhammikathan ti*, and similarly elsewhere; alternative form.

**Tena kho pana samayena**

Then at that time

**Tattha, 'Tena kho pana samayenā,' ti**  
Herein, 'Then at that time,'

**Bhagavā Mahāpajāpatiā yācito, Bhikkhuniśaṅghaṃ uyyojetvā,**  
when the Fortunate One was requested by Mahāpajāpatī, after sending the Community of nuns away,

**Bhikkhusaṅghaṃ sannipātetvā:**  
and gathering the Community of monks,

**"Therā bhikkhū vārena bhikkhuniyo ovadantū," ti**  
saying: "Elder monks must instruct the nuns in turns,"

**Saṅghassa bhāraṃ akāsi.**  
he gave this task to the Community.

**Taṃ sandhāyetam vuttaṃ.**  
It was said regarding this.

**Therā bhikkhū bhikkhuniyo ovadanti pariyāyena,**  
the Elder monks were advising the nuns in turns,

**Tattha, 'Pariyāyenā' ti vārena.**  
Herein, 'In turns' means in order.

**āyasmā pana<sup>4</sup> Nandako na icchati bhikkhuniyo ovaditum pariyāyena.**  
but Venerable Nandaka did not wish to advise the nuns in (his) turn.

**Atha kho Bhagavā āyasmantaṃ Ānandaṃ āmantesi:**  
Then the Fortunate One addressed venerable Ānanda:

**"Kassa nu kho, Ānanda, ajja pariyāyo bhikkhuniyo ovaditum pariyāyenā?" ti**  
"Whose turn is it today, Ānanda, to advise the nuns?"

**"Nandakassa, Bhante, pariyāyo<sup>5</sup> bhikkhuniyo ovaditum pariyāyena,**  
"Reverend Sir, it is Nandaka's turn to advise the nuns,

**ayaṃ, Bhante, āyasmā Nandako na icchati bhikkhuniyo ovaditum pariyāyenā." ti**  
(but) this venerable Nandaka does not wish to advise the nuns in (his) turn."

---

<sup>4</sup> ChS omits: *pana*, but then the meaning has to be supplied.

<sup>5</sup> RTE, ChS: *Sabbeheva, Bhante, kato pariyāyo; all of the (others), reverend Sir, have had a turn.*

## Nandaka's Advice - 7

**‘Na icchatī,’ ti attano vāre sampatte,**

‘Does not wish,’ means when his own turn arrived,

**dūram gāmaṃ vā gantvā, sūcikkammādīni vā ārabhitvā,**

having gone to a faraway village, or having begun his needlework and so on,

**“Ayaṃ nāmassa papañco,” ti vadāpesi.**

he had him say: “This is surely an obstacle for him.”

**Imaṃ pana pariyāyena ovādaṃ Bhagavā Nandakattherasseva kāraṇā akāsi.**

But the Fortunate One gave this advice to the Elder Nandaka about taking turns.

**Kasmā?**

Why?

**Imāsañhi bhikkhunīnaṃ Theram disvā cittaṃ ekaggam hoti pasīdati.**

For when those nuns saw the Elder their mind became tranquil and clear.

**Tena tā tassa ovādaṃ sampaṭicchitukāmā, Dhammakathaṃ sotukāmā.**

Therefore they liked to accept his advice, and liked to listen to his talk on Dhamma.

**Tasmā Bhagavā:**

Therefore the Fortunate One (said):

**“Nandako attano vāre sampatte ovādaṃ dassati,**

“When Nandaka’s turn arrives he should give advice,

**Dhammakathaṃ kathessatī,” ti vārena ovādaṃ akāsi.**

he should give a Dhamma talk,” it means he should give advice in his turn.

**Thero pana attano vāram na karoti, kasmā ti ce?**

But if the Elder didn’t take his turn, why is that?

**Tā kira bhikkhuniyo pubbe Therassa Jambudīpe rajjaṃ kārentassa orodhā ahesuṃ.**

It seems that formerly those nuns had made up his harem when he had ruled over the Rose Apple Isle.

**Thero pubbenivāsaññāna taṃ kāraṇaṃ ñatvā cintesi:**

The Elder, knowing this through his knowledge of previous lives, thought:

**‘Maṃ imassa Bhikkhunisāṅghassa majjhe nisinnaṃ**

‘Sitting in the midst of this Community of nuns

**upamāyo ca kāraṇāni ca āharitvā,**

and bringing forward similes and reasons,

**dhammaṃ kathayamānaṃ disvā,**

and being seen preaching the Dhamma,

**añño pubbenivāsaññalābhī bhikkhu imaṃ kāraṇaṃ oloketvā,**

(if) another monk who also had knowledge of previous lives looked at the reason for it,



## Nandaka's Advice - 8

**“Āyasmā Nandako yāvajjadasā orodhe na vissajjeti,**

° he might think he could say: “Venerable Nandaka up to this day did not send off his concubines,

**sobhatāyam-āyasmā orodhaparivuto,” ti vattabbaṃ maññeyyā.’ ti**

this venerable is resplendent when surrounded by his concubines.”

**Etam-atthaṃ sampassamāno Thero attano vāraṃ na karoti.**

Understanding this matter the Elder did not take his turn.

**Imāsañ-ca kira bhikkhunīnaṃ Therasseva desanā sappāyā bhavissatī ti ñatvā,**

But understanding that it will be beneficial for the Elder to preach to those nuns, it seems,

**atha kho Bhagavā āyasmantaṃ Nandakaṃ āmantesi.**

the Fortunate One then addressed the venerable Nandaka.

**Tāsaṃ bhikkhunīnaṃ pubbe tassa orodhabhāvajānanatthaṃ idaṃ vatthum:**

In order to understand when these nuns were previously in his harem, there is this story:

**Pubbe kira Bārāṇasiyaṃ pañca dāsasatāni pañca dāsīsātāni cā ti,**

Formerly, it seems, in Bārāṇasī there were five hundred male slave and five hundred female slaves,

**jaṅghasahassaṃ ekato va kammaṃ katvā, ekasmim̐ ṭhāne vasi.**

and as these thousand people did their work together, they dwelt in one place.

**Ayaṃ Nandakatthero tasmim̐ kāle jeṭṭhakadāso hoti, Gotamī jeṭṭhakadāsī.**

At that time this Elder Nandaka was the senior male slave, and Gotamī was the senior female slave.

**Sā jeṭṭhakadāsassa pādapariçārikā ahoṣi, paṇḍitā byattā.**

She was the senior male slave's attendant, and was wise and learned.

**Jaṅghasahassaṃ-pi puññakammaṃ karontaṃ, ekato karoti.**

The thousand people who were making meritorious deeds, acted together.

**Atha vassūpanāyikasamaye,**

Then, as the time for the Rains Retreat was approaching,

**pañca Paccekabuddhā Nandamūlakapabbhārato Isipatane otarivā,**

five Independent Buddhas descended from mount Nandamūlaka to Isipatana,

**nagare piṇḍāya carivā, Isipatanam-eva gantvā,**

wandered for alms in the city, and after going (back) to Isipatana,

**‘Vassūpanāyikakuṭiyā atthāya hatthakammaṃ yācissāmā.’ ti**

thought: ‘We will ask for manual labour in order to prepare the huts for spending the Rains.’

**Cīvaraṃ pārupitvā, sāyanhasamaye nagaraṃ pavisitvā,**

Having wrapped the robe, they entered the city in the evening time,

**seṭṭhissa gharadvāre aṭṭhamsu.**

and stood at the gate of the treasurer's house.

**Jeṭṭhakadāsī, kuṭam gahetvā udakatittham gacchantī**

The chief female slave took a waterpot and while going to the reservoir

**Paccekabuddhe nagaram pavisante addasa.**

saw the Independent Buddhas entering the city.

**Seṭṭhi, tesam āgatakāraṇam sutvā,**

The treasurer, after hearing why they had come,

**“Amhākam okāso natthi, gacchantū!” ti āha.**

said: “You do not have our permission, please go!”

**Atha, te nagarā nikkhante,**

Then, as they were leaving the city,

**jeṭṭhakadāsī, kuṭam gahetvā, pavisantī disvā,**

the chief female slave, took her waterpot and seeing them entering,

**kuṭam otāretvā, vanditvā, onamitvā, mukham ukkhipitvā,**

put down the waterpot, worshipped, bent down, lifted up her face,

**“Ayyā, nagaram paviṭṭhamattāva, nikkhantā kiṃ nu kho?” ti pucchi.**

and asked: “Noble Ones, having just entered the city, why are you (now) leaving?”

**“Vassūpanāyikakuṭiyā hatthakammam yācitum āgatamhā.” ti**

“We came to ask for manual labour to prepare the huts for spending the Rains.”

**“Laddham Bhante?” ti**

“Did you receive it, venerable Sirs?”

**“Na laddham upāsike.” ti**

“We did not receive it, lay woman.”

**“Kiṃ panesā kuṭi issareheva kātabbā?**

“But can these huts only be made by the powerful?”

**Duggate hi pi sakkā kātun?”-ti**

Is it possible also for the lowly to build (them)?”

**“Yena kenaci sakkā kātun.”-ti**

“It is possible for anyone to build (them).”

**“Sādhu Bhante mayam karissāma,**

“Very well, venerable Sirs, we will build (them),

**sve mayham bhikkham gaṇhathā,” ti nimantetvā,**

tomorrow please accept our almsfood,” and after inviting (them),

**udakam netvā, puna kuṭam gahetvā, āgamanatitthamagge ṭhatvā,**

she led them to the water, took the waterpot, placed it on the road going to the reservoir,

**āgatāgatā avasesadāsiyo: “Ettheva hothā,” ti vatvā,**

and as the other female slaves came and went, she said: “Wait here,”

**sabbāsaṃ āgatakāle āha:**

and when everyone had assembled, she said:

**“Ammā, kiṃ niccam-eva parassa dāsakammaṃ karissatha,**

“Ladies, will we always be doing slave-work for another,

**udāhu dāsabhāvato mucchitum icchathā?” ti**

or do you wish to be free of this slavery?”

**“Ajjeva mucchitum icchāma, Ayye.” ti**

“Noble Lady, today itself we wish to be free.”

**“Yadi evaṃ mayā pañca Paccekabuddhā hatthakammaṃ alabhantā**

“When these five Independent Buddhas didn't receive manual labour

**svātanāya nimantitā.**

they were invited by me for tomorrow.

**Tumhākaṃ sāmikehi ekadivasam hatthakammaṃ dāpethā.” ti**

Have your husbands give manual labour for a day.”

**Tā: “Sādhū!” ti, sampañcchitvā,**

They replied: “Very well!”

**sāyaṃ aṭavito āgatakāle sāmikānaṃ ārocesum.**

and informed their husbands when they returned from the forest.

**Te: “Sādhū!” ti, jeṭṭhakadāsassa gehadvāre sannipatiṃsu.**

They (also) said: “Very well!” and assembled at the chief male slave's door.

**Atha ne jeṭṭhakadāsī:**

Then the chief female slave said to them:

**“Sve Tātā Paccekabuddhānaṃ hatthakammaṃ dethā,” ti**

“Tomorrow, Dears, you must give manual labour to the Independent Buddhas,”

**ānisaṃsaṃ ācikkhitvā, ye pi na kātukāmā,**

and she explained the advantages, and even those who did not desire to do it (at first),

**te gāḷhena ovādena tajjetvā pañcchāpesi.**

after she had given them strong advice, agreed.

**Sā punadvase Paccekabuddhānaṃ bhantaṃ datvā,**

On the next day, after giving food to the Independent Buddhas,

**sabbesaṃ dāsaputtānaṃ saññaṃ adāsi.**

she informed all the slaves.

**Te tāvad-eva araṇṇaṃ pavisitvā, dabbasambhāre samodhānetvā,**

They entered the wilderness straight away, assembled the timber,

**sataṃ sataṃ hutvā, ekekakuṭṭim ekakaṅkamanādiparivāraṃ katvā,**

gathered in hundreds, made each of them a hut together with a walking meditation path,

**mañcapīṭhapānīyaparibhojanīyādīni ṭhapetvā,**

and placed suitable beds, chairs and drinks,

**Paccekabuddhe temāsam tattha vasanatthāya paṭiññam kāretvā,**

and made the Independent Buddhas promise to spend the three months<sup>6</sup> right there,

**vārabhikkham paṭṭhapesum.**

and prepared excellent almsfood (for them).

**Yo attano vāradivase na sakkoti,**

For those who were not able to take the opportunity (to give) on their day,

**tassā jeṭṭhakadāsī sakagehato āharitvā deti.**

the chief female slave took (food) from her own house and gave it.

**Evaṃ temāsam jaggitvā,**

After looking after them for three months,

**jeṭṭhakadāsī ekekaṃ dāsam ekekaṃ sātakam visajjāpesi,**

the chief female slave had each of the male slaves prepare cloth,

**pañca thūlasāṭakasatāni ahesum.**

and they made five-hundred coarse cloths.

**Tāni parivattāpetvā, pañcannaṃ Paccekabuddhānaṃ ticīvarāni katvā adāsi.**

After exchanging them, and having the three robes made, she gave (a set to each of) the five Independent Buddhas.

**Paccekabuddhā yathāphāsukaṃ agamaṃsu.**

The Independent Buddhas then departed according to their own convenience.

**Tam-pi jaṅghasahassaṃ ekato kusalam katvā,**

Those thousand people having done good deeds together,

**kāyassa bheda devaloke nibbatti.**

at the break up of the body were reborn in the world of the gods.

**Tāni pañca mātugāmasatāni kālena kālam**

Those five hundred women from time to time

**tesaṃ pañcannaṃ purisatānaṃ gehe honti,**

were (reborn) in the homes of the five hundred men,

**kālena kālam sabbā pi jeṭṭhakadāsaputtasseva gehe honti.**

and from time to time all were (reborn) in the home of the chief male slave.

---

<sup>6</sup> The period of the Rains Retreat.

## Nandaka's Advice - 12

**Atha ekasmiṃ kāle jeṭṭhakadāsaputto devalokato cavitvā Rājakule nibbatto.**

Then at one time the chief male slave, having fallen from the world of the gods, was reborn in a Princely family.

**Tā pi pañcasatā devakaññā, mahābhogakulesu nibbattivā,**

Those five hundred goddesses, after being reborn in very wealthy families,

**tassa rajje ʒhitassa gehaṃ agamaṃsu.**

ruled over his home, and then departed.

**Etena niyāmena saṃsarantiyo, amhākaṃ Bhagavato kāle**

Transmigrating in this way, at the time of our Fortunate One

**Koliyanagare Devadahanagare ca khattiyakulesu nibbattā.**

they were reborn in warrior families in the towns of Koliya and Devadaha.

**Nandakatthero pi pabbajitvā Arahattaṃ patto.**

After going forth the Elder Nandaka attained Liberation.

**Jeṭṭhakadāsīdhītā vyaṃ āgamma**

When the senior slave's daughter came of age

**Suddhodanamahārājassa Aggamahesiṭṭhāne ʒhitā,**

she was established in the position of the Great King Suddhodana's Chief Queen,

**itarā pi tesāṃ tesāṃ Rājaputtānaṃ yeva gharaṃ gatā.**

and the rest of them went to the houses of the Princes' sons.

**Tāsaṃ sāmikā pañcasatā Rājakumārā udakacumbaṭakalahe,**

Their husbands, the five hundred Princes, at the end of the string of quarrels about water,

**Satthu Dhammadesanaṃ sutvā pabbajitā,**

having heard the Teacher's Dhamma teaching went forth,

**Rājadhītarō tesāṃ ukkaṅṭhanatthaṃ sāsaṃ pesesaṃ.**

and sent a message to those Princesses about their dissatisfaction.

**Te ukkaṅṭhite Bhagavā Kuṇāladahaṃ netvā, Sotāpattiphale patiṭṭhapetvā,**

The Fortunate One led those who were dissatisfied to the Kuṇāla Lake, established them in the fruit of Stream-Entry,

**Mahāsamayadivase Arahatte patiṭṭhāpesi.**

and on the day of the Great Assembly established them in Liberation.

**Tā pi pañcasatā Rājadhītarō nikkhamitvā,**

The five hundred Princesses, having renounced,

**Mahāpajāpatiyā santike pabbajimsu.**

went forth in the presence of Mahāpajāpatī.

**Ayam-āyasmā Nandako ettāva tā bhikkhuniyo ti:**

So much for venerable Nandaka and the nuns:

**Evam-etaṃ vatthu dīpetabbaṃ.**

This is how the story should be seen.

**Atha kho Bhagavā āyasmantaṃ Nandakaṃ āmantesi:**

Then the Fortunate One addressed the venerable Nandaka:

**“Ovada, Nandaka, bhikkhuniyo, anusāsa, Nandaka, bhikkhuniyo,**

“Advise the nuns, Nandaka, instruct the nuns, Nandaka,

**karohi tvaṃ, brāhmaṇa, bhikkhunīnaṃ Dhammiṃ kathan.”-ti**

give a Dhamma talk to the nuns, brāhmaṇa.”

**“Evaṃ, Bhante,” ti kho so<sup>7</sup> āyasmā Nandako, Bhagavato paṭissutvā,**

“Very well, reverend Sir,” and venerable Nandaka, having replied to the Fortunate One,

**pubbaṅhasamayaṃ nivāsetvā,**

dressed in the morning time,

**pattacīvaram-ādāya<sup>8</sup> Sāvattṃ piṇḍāya pāvisi.**

and picked up his bowl and robe, entered Sāvattṃ for alms.

**Sāvattṃhiyaṃ piṇḍāya caritvā, pacchābhattaṃ piṇḍapātaṭikkanto attadutiyo,**

After walking for alms in Sāvattṃ, and while returning from the alms-round with his attendant after the meal,

**yena Rājakārāmo tenupasaṅkamaṃ.**

he approached the King's monastery.<sup>9</sup>

**‘Rājakārāmo’ ti Pasenadinā kārīto**

‘The King's monastery’ means the monastery that was built by (King) Pasenadi

**nagarassa dakkhiṇadisābhāge Thūpārāmasadise ṭhāne vihāro.**

in the southern part of the city (of Sāvattṃ), in a position similar to the Thūpārāma.<sup>10</sup>

**Addasaṃsu<sup>11</sup> kho tā bhikkhuniyo āyasmantaṃ Nandakaṃ dūrato va āgacchantāṃ.**

Those nuns saw the venerable Nandaka coming while still far away,

**Disvāna āsanaṃ paññāpesuṃ, udakañ-ca pādānaṃ upaṭṭhapesuṃ.**

and having seen (him), they prepared a seat, and had water set up for (washing) the feet.

**Nisīdi kho āyasmā Nandako paññatte āsane, nisajja pāde pakkhālesi.**

Venerable Nandaka sat down on the prepared seat, and while sitting he washed his feet.

---

<sup>7</sup> ChS omits *so*.

<sup>8</sup> BJT, PTS: *pattacīvaram ādāya*, and similarly elsewhere; difference in sandhi.

<sup>9</sup> This was a monastery built for the nuns by King Pasenadi on the advice of the Buddha after Ven. Uppalavaṇṇa was raped while living alone in the forest.

<sup>10</sup> A famous monastery in the south of Anurādhapūra, Sri Lanka at the time of the Commentator.

<sup>11</sup> RTE, PTS: *Addasāsum*, alternative form.

**Tā pi kho bhikkhuniyo āyasmantam Nandakam abhivādetvā,**  
Those nuns worshipped venerable Nandaka

**ekam-antam nisīdimsu.**  
and sat down on one side.

**Ekam-antam nisinnā kho tā bhikkhuniyo āyasmā Nandako etad-avoca:**  
While sitting on one side venerable Nandaka said this to those nuns:

**“Paṭipucchakathā kho, bhaginiyo, bhavissati,**  
“Sisters, this will be a talk in which I put questions,

**tattha ājānantīhi: ‘Ājānāmā,’ tissa vacanīyam,**  
herein, when you understand, you should say: ‘We understand,’

**na ājānantīhi: ‘Na ājānāmā,’ tissa vacanīyam.**  
when you don’t understand, you should say: ‘We don’t understand.’

**Yassā vā panassa kaṅkhā vā vimati vā aham-eva tattha paṭipucchitabbo:**  
But if for you there is doubt or uncertainty herein you should ask in return:

**‘Idam, Bhante, katham, imassa kvattho?’ ” ti**  
“This that you said, reverend Sir, what is its meaning?” ”

**“Ettakena pi mayam, Bhante, ayyassa Nandakassa attamanā abhiraddhā,<sup>12</sup>**  
“So far, reverend Sir, we are uplifted and satisfied with the noble Nandaka,

**yam no ayyo Nandako pavāretī.” ti**  
and for the noble Nandaka making this invitation to us.”

### **The Instruction on the Internal Sense Spheres**

**“Tam kim maññatha, bhaginiyo, cakkhum<sup>13</sup> niccam vā aniccam vā?” ti**  
“What do you think of this, sisters, is the eye permanent or impermanent?”<sup>14</sup>

**“Aniccam, Bhante.”**  
“Impermanent, reverend Sir.”

**“Yam panāniccam dukkham vā tam sukham vā?” ti**  
“But that which is impermanent, is that unpleasant or pleasant?”

---

<sup>12</sup> PTS: *abhinandāma*, we greatly rejoice.

<sup>13</sup> RTE, ChS: *cakkhu*, alternative form.

<sup>14</sup> The following questions and answers are similar to the second recorded Discourse the Buddha gave, on the Characteristic of Non-Self, but here the questions are applied to the sense spheres rather than the constituents of mind and body.

**“Dukkhaṃ, Bhante.”**

“Unpleasant, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ paṇāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**

“But that which is unpleasant and changeable,

**kallaṃ nu taṃ samanupassituṃ:**

is it proper to regard it thus:

**“Etaṃ mama, esoham-asmi, eso<sup>15</sup> me Attā?” ti**

“This is mine, this I am, this is my Self?”

**“No hetāṃ, Bhante.”**

“Certainly not, reverend Sir.”

**“Taṃ kiṃ maññaṭha, bhaginiyo, sotaṃ niccaṃ vā aniccaṃ vā?” ti**

“What do you think of this, sisters, is the ear permanent or impermanent?”

**“Aniccaṃ, Bhante.”**

“Impermanent, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ paṇāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vā taṃ sukhaṃ vā?” ti**

“But that which is impermanent, is that unpleasant or pleasant?”

**“Dukkhaṃ, Bhante.”**

“Unpleasant, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ paṇāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**

“But that which is unpleasant and changeable,

**kallaṃ nu taṃ samanupassituṃ:**

is it proper to regard it thus:

**“Etaṃ mama, esoham-asmi, eso me Attā?” ti**

“This is mine, this I am, this is my Self?”

**“No hetāṃ, Bhante.”**

“Certainly not, reverend Sir.”

---

<sup>15</sup> PTS: *so*, and similarly elsewhere, alternative form of the pronoun.



**“Taṃ kiṃ maññatha, bhaginiyo, ghānaṃ niccaṃ vā aniccaṃ vā?” ti**  
“What do you think of this, sisters, is the nose permanent or impermanent?”

**“Aniccaṃ, Bhante.”**  
“Impermanent, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vā taṃ sukhaṃ vā?” ti**  
“But that which is impermanent, is that unpleasant or pleasant?”

**“Dukkhaṃ, Bhante.”**  
“Unpleasant, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**  
“But that which is unpleasant and changeable,

**kallaṃ nu taṃ samanupassituṃ:**  
is it proper to regard it thus:

**“Etaṃ mama, esoham-asmi, eso me Attā?” ” ti**  
“This is mine, this I am, this is my Self?” ”

**“No hetāṃ, Bhante.”**  
“Certainly not, reverend Sir.”

**“Taṃ kiṃ maññatha, bhaginiyo, jivhā niccā vā aniccā vā?” ti**  
“What do you think of this, sisters, is the tongue permanent or impermanent?”

**“Aniccā, Bhante.”**  
“Impermanent, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vā taṃ sukhaṃ vā?” ti**  
“But that which is impermanent, is that unpleasant or pleasant?”

**“Dukkhaṃ, Bhante.”**  
“Unpleasant, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**  
“But that which is unpleasant and changeable,

**kallaṃ nu taṃ samanupassituṃ:**  
is it proper to regard it thus:

**“Etaṃ mama, esoham-asmi, eso me Attā?” ” ti**  
“This is mine, this I am, this is my Self?” ”

**“No hetāṃ, Bhante.”**  
“Certainly not, reverend Sir.”

**“Taṃ kiṃ maññaṭha, bhaginiyo, kāyo nicco vā anicco vā?” ti**

“What do you think of this, sisters, is the body permanent or impermanent?”

**“Anicco, Bhante.”**

“Impermanent, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vā taṃ sukhaṃ vā?” ti**

“But that which is impermanent, is that unpleasant or pleasant?”

**“Dukkhaṃ, Bhante.”**

“Unpleasant, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**

“But that which is unpleasant and changeable,

**kallaṃ nu taṃ samanupassituṃ:**

is it proper to regard it thus:

**‘Etaṃ mama, esoham-asmi, eso me Attā?’ ” ti**

“This is mine, this I am, this is my Self? ”

**“No hetāṃ, Bhante.”**

“Certainly not, reverend Sir.”

**“Taṃ kiṃ maññaṭha, bhaginiyo, mano nicco vā anicco vā?” ti**

“What do you think of this, sisters, is the mind permanent or impermanent?”

**“Anicco, Bhante.”**

“Impermanent, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vā taṃ sukhaṃ vā?” ti**

“But that which is impermanent, is that unpleasant or pleasant?”

**“Dukkhaṃ, Bhante.”**

“Unpleasant, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**

“But that which is unpleasant and changeable,

**kallaṃ nu taṃ samanupassituṃ:**

is it proper to regard it thus:

**‘Etaṃ mama, esoham-asmi, eso me Attā?’ ” ti**

“This is mine, this I am, this is my Self? ”

**“No hetāṃ, Bhante.**

“Certainly not, reverend Sir.

**Taṃ kissa hetu?**<sup>16</sup>

What is the reason for that?

**Pubbe va no hetam,**<sup>17</sup> **Bhante, yathābhūtaṃ sammappaññāya sudiṭṭham:**

Previously, reverend Sir, this was well seen by us, as it really is, with perfect wisdom:

**‘Sammappaññāya sudiṭṭhan,’-ti**

‘Well seen ... with perfect wisdom,’

**hetunā kāraṇena vipassanāpaññāya, yāthāvasarasato diṭṭham.**

seen, at the time it really exists, with cause, with reason, with the wisdom of insight.

**‘Iti pi me cha ajjhattikā āyatanā aniccā.’ ” ti**

‘These six internal sense spheres are impermanent.’ ”

**“Sādhu, sādhu, bhaginiyo!**

“Very good, very good, sisters!

**Evam hetam, bhaginiyo,**

This is the way, sisters,

**hoti ariyasāvakaṃ yathābhūtaṃ sammappaññāya passato.**

for a noble disciple who sees it as it really is, with perfect wisdom.

### **The Instruction on the External Sense Spheres**

**Taṃ kiṃ maññatha, bhaginiyo, rūpā niccā vā aniccā vā” ti?**

What do you think of this, sisters, are forms permanent or impermanent?”

**“Aniccā, Bhante.”**

“Impermanent, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vā taṃ sukhaṃ vā?” ti**

“But that which is impermanent, is that unpleasant or pleasant?”

**“Dukkhaṃ, Bhante.”**

“Unpleasant, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**

“But that which is unpleasant and changeable,

**kallaṃ nu taṃ samanupassituṃ:**

is it proper to regard it thus:

---

<sup>16</sup> ChS punctuates that this as though it is a new speaker here and in similar positions; but it is clear this is a rhetorical question, and there are no quotation markers to indicate otherwise.

<sup>17</sup> ChS: *etaṃ*.

**‘Etaṃ mama, esoham-asmi, eso me Attā?’ ” ti**

“This is mine, this I am, this is my Self?” ”

**“No hetam, Bhante.”**

“Certainly not, reverend Sir.”

**‘Taṃ kiṃ maññatha, bhaginiyo, saddā niccā vā aniccā vā?’ ” ti**

“What do you think of this, sisters, are sounds permanent or impermanent?”

**“Aniccā, Bhante.”**

“Impermanent, reverend Sir.”

**‘Yaṃ panāniccam dukkhaṃ vā taṃ sukhaṃ vā?’ ” ti**

“But that which is impermanent, is that unpleasant or pleasant?”

**“Dukkhaṃ, Bhante.”**

“Unpleasant, reverend Sir.”

**‘Yaṃ panāniccam dukkhaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**

“But that which is unpleasant and changeable,

**kallaṃ nu taṃ samanupassituṃ:**

is it proper to regard it thus:

**‘Etaṃ mama, esoham-asmi, eso me Attā?’ ” ti**

“This is mine, this I am, this is my Self?” ”

**“No hetam, Bhante.”**

“Certainly not, reverend Sir.”

**‘Taṃ kiṃ maññatha, bhaginiyo, gandhā<sup>18</sup> niccā vā aniccā vā?’ ” ti**

“What do you think of this, sisters, are smells permanent or impermanent?”

**“Aniccā, Bhante.”**

“Impermanent, reverend Sir.”

**‘Yaṃ panāniccam dukkhaṃ vā taṃ sukhaṃ vā?’ ” ti**

“But that which is impermanent, is that unpleasant or pleasant?”

**“Dukkhaṃ, Bhante.”**

“Unpleasant, reverend Sir.”

**‘Yaṃ panāniccam dukkhaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**

“But that which is unpleasant and changeable,

---

<sup>18</sup> PTS omits any peyyāla sign here, writing *Aniccā, Bhante. Gandhā niccā...* and so on throughout.

**kallaṃ nu taṃ samanupassituṃ:**

is it proper to regard it thus:

**“Etaṃ mama, esoham-asmi, eso me Attā?” ” ti**

“This is mine, this I am, this is my Self?” ”

**“No hetam, Bhante.”**

“Certainly not, reverend Sir.”

**“Taṃ kiṃ maññatha, bhaginiyo, rasā niccā vā aniccā vā?” ti**

“What do you think of this, sisters, are tastes permanent or impermanent?”

**“Aniccā, Bhante.”**

“Impermanent, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vā taṃ sukhaṃ vā?” ti**

“But that which is impermanent, is that unpleasant or pleasant?”

**“Dukkhaṃ, Bhante.”**

“Unpleasant, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**

“But that which is unpleasant and changeable,

**kallaṃ nu taṃ samanupassituṃ:**

is it proper to regard it thus:

**“Etaṃ mama, esoham-asmi, eso me Attā?” ” ti**

“This is mine, this I am, this is my Self?” ”

**“No hetam, Bhante.”**

“Certainly not, reverend Sir.”

**“Taṃ kiṃ maññatha, bhaginiyo, phoṭṭhabbā niccā vā aniccā vā?” ti**

“What do you think of this, sisters, are touches permanent or impermanent?”

**“Aniccā, Bhante.”**

“Impermanent, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vā taṃ sukhaṃ vā?” ti**

“But that which is impermanent, is that unpleasant or pleasant?”

**“Dukkhaṃ, Bhante.”**

“Unpleasant, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**

“But that which is unpleasant and changeable,

**kallaṃ nu taṃ samanupassituṃ:**

is it proper to regard it thus:

**‘Etaṃ mama, esoham-asmi, eso me Attā?’ ” ti**

‘This is mine, this I am, this is my Self?’ ”

**‘No hetam, Bhante.’**

‘Certainly not, reverend Sir.’

**‘Taṃ kiṃ maññatha, bhaginiyo, dhammā niccā vā aniccā vā?’ ti**

‘What do you think of this, sisters, are thoughts permanent or impermanent?’

**‘Aniccā, Bhante.’**

‘Impermanent, reverend Sir.’

**‘Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vā taṃ sukhaṃ vā?’ ti**

‘But that which is impermanent, is that unpleasant or pleasant?’

**‘Dukkhaṃ, Bhante.’**

‘Unpleasant, reverend Sir.’

**‘Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**

‘But that which is unpleasant and changeable,

**kallaṃ nu taṃ samanupassituṃ:**

is it proper to regard it thus:

**‘Etaṃ mama, esoham-asmi, eso me Attā?’ ” ti<sup>19</sup>**

‘This is mine, this I am, this is my Self?’ ”

**‘No hetam, Bhante.**

‘Certainly not, reverend Sir.

**Taṃ kissa hetu?**

What is the reason for that?

**Pubbe va no hetam, Bhante, yathābhūtaṃ sammappaññāya sudiṭṭhaṃ:**

Previously, reverend Sir, this was well seen by us, as it really is, with perfect wisdom:

**‘Iti pi me cha bāhirā āyatanā aniccā.’ ” ti**

‘These six external sense spheres are impermanent.’ ”

**‘Sādhu, sādhu, bhaginiyo!**

‘Very good, very good, sisters!

---

<sup>19</sup> PTS employs elipsis: *kallaṃ nu taṃ . . . attā ti*.

**Evam hetam, bhaginiyo,**

This is the way, sisters,

**hoti ariyasāvakaṣa yathābhūtaṁ sammappaññāya passato.**

for a noble disciple who sees it as it really is, with perfect wisdom.

### **The Instruction on the Six Consciousnesses**

**Tam kiṁ maññatha, bhaginiyo, cakkhaviññāṇaṁ niccaṁ vā aniccaṁ vā?” ti**

What do you think of this, sisters, is eye-consciousness permanent or impermanent?”

**“Aniccaṁ, Bhante.”**

“Impermanent, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṁ panāniccaṁ dukkhaṁ vā taṁ sukhaṁ vā?” ti**

“But that which is impermanent, is that unpleasant or pleasant?”

**“Dukkhaṁ, Bhante.”**

“Unpleasant, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṁ panāniccaṁ dukkhaṁ vipariṇāmadhammaṁ,**

“But that which is unpleasant and changeable,

**kallaṁ nu taṁ samanupassituṁ:**

is it proper to regard it thus:

**“Etaṁ mama, esoḥam-asmi, eso me Attā?” ti**

“This is mine, this I am, this is my Self?”

**“No hetam, Bhante.”**

“Certainly not, reverend Sir.”

**“Tam kiṁ maññatha, bhaginiyo, sotaviññāṇaṁ niccaṁ vā aniccaṁ vā?” ti**

“What do you think of this, sisters, is ear-consciousness permanent or impermanent?”

**“Aniccaṁ, Bhante.”**

“Impermanent, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṁ panāniccaṁ dukkhaṁ vā taṁ sukhaṁ vā?” ti**

“But that which is impermanent, is that unpleasant or pleasant?”

**“Dukkhaṁ, Bhante.”**

“Unpleasant, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṁ panāniccaṁ dukkhaṁ vipariṇāmadhammaṁ,**

“But that which is unpleasant and changeable,

**kallaṃ nu taṃ samanupassituṃ:**

is it proper to regard it thus:

**“Etaṃ mama, esoḥam-asmi, eso me Attā?”**” ti

“This is mine, this I am, this is my Self?”

**“No hetāṃ, Bhante.”**

“Certainly not, reverend Sir.”

**“Taṃ kiṃ maññatha, bhaginiyo, ghānaviññāṇaṃ niccaṃ vā aniccaṃ vā?”**” ti

“What do you think of this, sisters, is nose-consciousness permanent or impermanent?”

**“Aniccaṃ, Bhante.”**

“Impermanent, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vā taṃ sukhaṃ vā?”**” ti

“But that which is impermanent, is that unpleasant or pleasant?”

**“Dukkhaṃ, Bhante.”**

“Unpleasant, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**

“But that which is unpleasant and changeable,

**kallaṃ nu taṃ samanupassituṃ:**

is it proper to regard it thus:

**“Etaṃ mama, esoḥam-asmi, eso me Attā?”**” ti

“This is mine, this I am, this is my Self?”

**“No hetāṃ, Bhante.”**

“Certainly not, reverend Sir.”

**“Taṃ kiṃ maññatha, bhaginiyo, jivhāviññāṇaṃ niccaṃ vā aniccaṃ vā?”**” ti

“What do you think of this, sisters, is tongue-consciousness permanent or impermanent?”

**“Aniccaṃ, Bhante.”**<sup>20</sup>

“Impermanent, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vā taṃ sukhaṃ vā?”**” ti

“But that which is impermanent, is that unpleasant or pleasant?”

**“Dukkhaṃ, Bhante.”**

“Unpleasant, reverend Sir.”

---

<sup>20</sup> PTS omits the lines from *jivhāviññāṇaṃ* to *Bhante* by mistake.



**“Yaṃ paṇāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**  
“But that which is unpleasant and changeable,

**kallaṃ nu taṃ samanupassituṃ:**  
is it proper to regard it thus:

**“Etaṃ mama, esoham-asmi, eso me Attā?”” ti**  
“This is mine, this I am, this is my Self?””

**“No hetāṃ, Bhante.”**  
“Certainly not, reverend Sir.”

**“Taṃ kiṃ maññaṭha, bhaginiyo, kāyaviññāṇaṃ niccaṃ vā aniccaṃ vā?”” ti**  
“What do you think of this, sisters, is body-consciousness permanent or impermanent?””

**“Aniccaṃ, Bhante.”**  
“Impermanent, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ paṇāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vā taṃ sukhaṃ vā?”” ti**  
“But that which is impermanent, is that unpleasant or pleasant?””

**“Dukkhaṃ, Bhante.”**  
“Unpleasant, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ paṇāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**  
“But that which is unpleasant and changeable,

**kallaṃ nu taṃ samanupassituṃ:**  
is it proper to regard it thus:

**“Etaṃ mama, esoham-asmi, eso me Attā?”” ti**  
“This is mine, this I am, this is my Self?””

**“No hetāṃ, Bhante.”**  
“Certainly not, reverend Sir.”

**“Taṃ kiṃ maññaṭha, bhaginiyo, manoviññāṇaṃ niccaṃ vā aniccaṃ vā?”” ti**  
“What do you think of this, sisters, is mind-consciousness permanent or impermanent?””

**“Aniccaṃ, Bhante.”**  
“Impermanent, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ paṇāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vā taṃ sukhaṃ vā?”” ti**  
“But that which is impermanent, is that unpleasant or pleasant?””

**“Dukkhaṃ, Bhante.”**  
“Unpleasant, reverend Sir.”

**“Yam panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**  
“But that which is unpleasant and changeable,

**kallaṃ nu taṃ samanupassitum:**  
is it proper to regard it thus:

**‘Etaṃ mama, esoham-asmi, eso me Attā?’ ” ti**  
“This is mine, this I am, this is my Self?’ ”

**“No hetam, Bhante.**  
“Certainly not, reverend Sir.

**Tam kissa hetu?**  
What is the reason for that?

**Pubbe va no hetam, Bhante, yathābhūtaṃ sammappaññāya sudiṭṭham:**  
Previously, reverend Sir, this was well seen by us, as it really is, with perfect wisdom:

**‘Iti pi me cha viññāṇakāyā aniccā.’ ” ti**  
“These six kinds of consciousness are impermanent.’ ”

**“Sādhu, sādhu, bhaginiyo!**  
“Very good, very good, sisters!

**Evaṃ hetam, bhaginiyo,**  
This is the way, sisters,

**hoti ariyasāvakaṃ yathābhūtaṃ sammappaññāya passato.**  
for a noble disciple who sees it as it really is, with perfect wisdom.

### The Oil Lamp Simile

**Seyyathā pi, bhaginiyo, telappadīpassa jhāyato,**  
Suppose, sisters, when an oil lamp is burning

**telaṃ-pi aniccaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**  
the oil is impermanent and changeable,

**vaṭṭi<sup>21</sup> pi aniccā vipariṇāmadhammā,**  
the wick is impermanent and changeable,

**accī<sup>22</sup> pi aniccā vipariṇāmadhammā,**  
the flame is impermanent and changeable,

**ābhā pi aniccā vipariṇāmadhammā.**  
the radiance is impermanent and changeable.

---

<sup>21</sup> PTS: *vaṭṭī*, and similarly elsewhere; alternative form.

<sup>22</sup> PTS: *accī*, and similarly elsewhere; alternative form.

**Yo nu kho, bhaginiyo, evaṃ vadeyya:**

He who would say this, sisters:

**‘Amussa telappadīpassa jhāyato, telam-pi aniccaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**  
‘For this oil lamp that is burning the oil is impermanent and changeable,

**vaṭṭi pi aniccā vipariṇāmadhammā,**  
the wick is impermanent and changeable,

**acci pi aniccā vipariṇāmadhammā,**  
the flame is impermanent and changeable,

**yā ca<sup>23</sup> khvāssa<sup>24</sup> ābhā sā niccā dhuvā sassatā avipariṇāmadhammā,’ ti**  
but the radiance is permanent, constant, eternal and unchangeable,’

**sammā nu kho so, bhaginiyo, vadamāno vadeyyā?’ ti**  
would someone speaking in this way, sisters, be speaking correctly?’

**‘No hetam, Bhante.**

‘Certainly not, reverend Sir.

**Tam kissa hetu?**

What is the reason for that?

**Amussa hi, Bhante, telappadīpassa jhāyato,**

For while this oil lamp is burning, reverend Sir,

**telam-pi aniccaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**  
the oil is impermanent and changeable,

**vaṭṭi pi aniccā vipariṇāmadhammā,**  
the wick is impermanent and changeable,

**acci pi aniccā vipariṇāmadhammā,**  
the flame is impermanent and changeable,

**pagevassa ābhā aniccā vipariṇāmadhammā?’ ti**  
then what to say of its radiance being impermanent and changeable?’

---

<sup>23</sup> BJT omits: *ca* here, but includes it in similar places elsewhere.

<sup>24</sup> RTE: *khvassa*, alternative form, here and elsewhere.

**“Evam-eva kho, bhaginiyo, yo nu kho evam vadeyya:**

“Just so he who would say this, sisters:

**‘Cha kho me<sup>25</sup> ajjhattikā āyatanā aniccā,**

‘These six internal sense-spheres are impermanent,

**yañ-ca kho cha ajjhattike āyatane paṭicca,**

but that which is conditioned by these six internal sense-spheres,

**paṭisaṃvedeti<sup>26</sup> sukhaṃ vā dukkhaṃ vā adukkhamasukhaṃ vā,**

the pleasant or painful or neither painful-nor-pleasant (feeling) that he feels,

**taṃ niccaṃ dhuvam sassaṭam vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,’-ti**

that is permanent, constant, eternal and unchangeable,’

**sammā nu kho so, bhaginiyo, vadamāno vadeyyā?’” ti**

would someone speaking in this way, sisters, be speaking correctly?”

**“No hetam, Bhante.**

“Certainly not, reverend Sir.

**Tam kissa hetu?**

What is the reason for that?

**Tajjam tajjam, Bhante, paccayam paṭicca, tadjā tadjā vedanā uppajjanti.<sup>27</sup>**

Whatever arises, reverend Sir, is conditioned by conditions, and with that arising feelings appear.

**‘Tajjam tajjan’-ti tamsabhāvam tamsabhāvam,**

‘Whatever arises’ means that which arises,

**atthato pana: ‘Tam tam paccayam paṭicca, tā tā vedanā uppajjanti,’ ti vuttam hoti.**

but the meaning is: ‘That which is conditioned by conditions, with just that feelings appear,’ this is what is said.

**Tajjassa tajjassa paccayassa nirodhā,**

With the cessation of the conditions for whatever arises,

**tadjā tadjā vedanā nirujjhanti.’”<sup>28</sup> ti**

whatever feelings have arisen cease.”

---

<sup>25</sup> BJT: *Cha kho hi imā*, here, but *Cha kho me* in the repetition; ChS: *Cha khome*, and similarly elsewhere.

<sup>26</sup> RTE, PTS: *paṭisaṃvedemi*; *that I feel*.

<sup>27</sup> RTE: *uppajjati*, here and elsewhere; singular form.

<sup>28</sup> RTE: *nirujjhati*, here and elsewhere; singular form.

**“Sādhu, sādhu, bhaginiyo!**

“Very good, very good, sisters!

**Evam hetam, bhaginiyo,**

This is the way, sisters,

**hoti ariyasāvakassa yathābhūtam sammappaññāya passato.**

for a noble disciple who sees it as it really is, with perfect wisdom.

### **The Big Tree Simile**

**Seyyathā pi, bhaginiyo, mahato rukkhassa tiṭṭhato sāravato,**

Suppose, sisters, when there is a big tree standing, having heartwood,

**mūlam-pi aniccaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**

the root is impermanent and changeable,

**khandho pi anicco vipariṇāmadhammo,**

the trunk is impermanent and changeable,

**sākhāpalāsam-pi aniccaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**

the branches and foilage are impermanent and changeable,

**chāyā pi aniccā vipariṇāmadhammā.**

the shadow is impermanent and changeable.

**Yo nu kho, bhaginiyo, evam vadeyya:**

He who would say this, sisters:

**‘Amussa mahato rukkhassa tiṭṭhato sāravato,**

‘For this big tree which is stood here, having heartwood,

**mūlam-pi aniccaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**

the root is impermanent and changeable,

**khandho pi anicco vipariṇāmadhammo,**

the trunk is impermanent and changeable,

**sākhāpalāsam-pi aniccaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**

the branches and foilage are impermanent and changeable,

**yā ca khvāssa chāyā sā niccā dhuvā sassatā avipariṇāmadhammā,’ ti**

but the shadow is permanent, constant, eternal and unchangeable,’

**sammā nu kho so, bhaginiyo, vadamāno vadeyyā?’ ti**

would someone speaking in this way, sisters, be speaking correctly?’”

**“No hetam, Bhante.**

“Certainly not, reverend Sir.

**Tam kissa hetu?**

What is the reason for that?

**Amussa hi, Bhante, mahato rukkhassa tiṭṭhato sāravato,**

For this big tree which is stood here, reverend Sir, having heartwood,

**mūlam-pi aniccaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**

the root is impermanent and changeable,

**khandho pi anicco vipariṇāmadhammo,**

the trunk is impermanent and changeable,

**sākhāpalāsam-pi aniccaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**

the branches and foilage are impermanent and changeable,

**pagevassa chāyā aniccā vipariṇāmadhammā?” ti**

then what to say of its shadow being impermanent and changeable?”

**‘Pagevassa chāyā,’ ti mūlādīni nissāya nibbattā chāyā paṭhamataram yeva aniccā.**

‘Then what to say of its shadow,’ of those things that exist because of the root and so on, the shadow is the most impermanent.

**“Evam-eva kho, bhaginiyo, yo nu kho evam vadeyya:**

“Just so he who would say this, sisters:

**‘Cha kho me bāhirā āyatanā aniccā,<sup>29</sup>**

‘These six external sense-spheres are impermanent,

**yañ-ca kho cha<sup>30</sup> bāhire āyatane paṭicca**

but that which is conditioned by these six external sense-spheres

**paṭisamvedeti sukhaṃ vā dukkhaṃ vā adukkhamasukhaṃ vā,**

the pleasant or painful or neither painful-nor-pleasant (feeling) that he feels,

**taṃ niccaṃ dhuvam sassatam avipariṇāmadhamman,’-ti**

that is permanent, constant, eternal and unchangeable,’

**sammā nu kho so, bhaginiyo, vadamāno vadeyyā?” ti**

would someone speaking in this way, sisters, be speaking correctly?”

---

<sup>29</sup> BJT, PTS add here: *vipariṇāmadhammā*, but not in a similar places above.

<sup>30</sup> RTE omits: *cha*, here and below.

**“No hetam, Bhante.**

“Certainly not, reverend Sir.

**Tam kissa hetu?**

What is the reason for that?

**Tajjam tajjam, Bhante, paccayam paṭicca,**

Whatever arises, reverend Sir, is conditioned by conditions,

**tajjā tajjā vedanā uppajjanti.**

and with that arising feelings appear.

**Tajjassa tajjassa paccayassa nirodhā,**

With the cessation of the conditions for whatever arises,

**tajjā tajjā vedanā nirujjhantī.” ti**

whatever feelings have arisen cease.”

**“Sādhu, sādhu, bhaginiyo!**

“Very good, very good, sisters!

**Evaṃ hetam, bhaginiyo,**

This is the way, sisters,

**hoti ariyasāvakaṃsa yathābhūtaṃ sammappaññāya passato.**

for a noble disciple who sees it as it really is, with perfect wisdom.

### The Cow Simile

**Seyyathā pi, bhaginiyo,**

Suppose, sisters,

**dakkho goghātako vā goghātakantevāsī vā, gāvim vadhitvā,**

a butcher or a butcher's apprentice, after killing a cow,

**tiṅhena govikantanena gāvim vikanteyya,<sup>31</sup>**

were to cut through the cow with a sharp butcher's knife,

**anupahacca antaram māmsakāyaṃ, anupahacca bāhiram cammakāyaṃ,**

without harming the flesh on the inside, and without harming the hide on the outside,

**‘Anupahaccā’ ti anupahanitvā.**

‘Without harming’ means without harming (different word form).

**Tattha, māmsam piṇḍam piṇḍam katvā**

Herein, by making balls of meat

---

<sup>31</sup> ChS: *saṅkanteyya*, and below; different word, but same meaning.

**cammaṃ alliyāpento maṃsakāyaṃ upahanati nāma;**  
the hide sticking to the flesh is damaged;

**cammaṃ baddhaṃ baddhaṃ katvā,**  
by kneading the hide,

**maṃse alliyāpento maṃsakāyaṃ upahanati nāma.**  
the flesh sticking to the hide is damaged.

**Evaṃ akatvā.**  
Without doing this.

**yaṃ yad-eva tattha, antarā vilimaṃsaṃ,<sup>32</sup> antarā nahāru,<sup>33</sup> antarā bandhanaṃ,**  
(but) whatever was right there, the flesh stuck to the inside, the sinew on the inside, the teguments on the inside,

**‘Vilimaṃsaṃ nhārubandhanan,’-ti sabbacamme laggavilimpanamaṃsam-eva.**  
‘Flesh stuck to the inside, the sinew, the teguments,’ means the flesh stuck and smeared on the hide.

**taṃ tad-eva tiṇhena govikantanena sañchindeyya,**  
(all) that he were to cut away from the cow with a sharp butcher's knife,

**saṅkanteyya<sup>34</sup> samparikanteyya,**  
were to cut it through, were to cut it out,

**sañchinditvā saṅkantitvā<sup>35</sup> samparikantitvā,**  
and after having cut it away, cut it through, cut it out,

**vidhunitvā bāhiraṃ cammakāyaṃ,**  
and removed the hide on the outside,

**teneva cammena taṃ gāviṃ paṭicchādetvā<sup>36</sup> evaṃ vadeyya:**  
and with the hide having covered that cow (again), were he to say thus:

**‘Tathevāyaṃ gāvī saṃyuttā iminā va<sup>37</sup> cammenā,’ ti**  
‘This cow is connected with its hide (again),’

**sammā nu kho so, bhaginiyo, vadamāno vadeyyā?’ ti**  
would someone speaking in this way, sisters, be speaking correctly?’

---

<sup>32</sup> PTS: *cilīmaṃ*; BJT: *vilīmaṃsaṃ*, both readings similarly elsewhere; the words are uncommon and the reading seems very uncertain.

<sup>33</sup> ChS: *nhāru*, and similarly elsewhere; alternative form.

<sup>34</sup> ChS adds: *sampakanteyya*, and similar forms elsewhere.

<sup>35</sup> ChS adds: *sampakantitvā*, and similar forms elsewhere.

<sup>36</sup> RTE adds here: *kiñcāpi so*; by mistake?

<sup>37</sup> RTE, PTS omit: *va*.



**“No hetam, Bhante.**

“Certainly not, reverend Sir.

**Tam kissa hetu?**

What is the reason for that?

**Amu hi, Bhante, dakkho goghātako vā goghātakantevāsī vā, gāvim vadhivā,**

For, reverend Sir, (if) a butcher or a butcher's apprentice, after killing a cow,

**tiṅhena govikantanena gāvim vikanteyya,**

were to cut through the cow with a sharp butcher's knife,

**anupahacca antaram māmsakāyam, anupahacca bāhiram cammakāyam,**

without harming the flesh on the inside, and without harming the hide on the outside,

**yam yad-eva tattha, antarā vilimaṃsam, antarā nahāru, antarā bandhanam,**

and whatever was right there, the flesh stuck to the inside, the sinew on the inside, the teguments on the inside,

**taṃ tad-eva tiṅhena govikantanena<sup>38</sup> sañchindeyya,**

(all) that he were to cut away from the cow with a sharp butcher's knife,

**saṅkanteyya samparikanteyya,**

were to cut it through, were to cut it out,

**sañchinditvā saṅkantitvā samparikantitvā,**

and after having cut it away, cut it through, cut it out,

**vidhunitvā bāhiram cammakāyam,**

and removed the hide on the outside,

**teneva cammena taṃ gāvim paṭicchādetvā, kiñcāpi so evaṃ vadeyya:**

and with the hide having covered that cow (again), were he to say thus:

**‘Tathevāyam gāvī saṃyuttā iminā va cammenā,’ ti**

‘This cow is connected with its hide (again),’

**atha kho sā gāvī visaṃyuttā teneva cammenā.” ti**

still that cow would not be connected with its hide (again).”

---

<sup>38</sup> RTE adds: *gāvim* here, but not in similar positions elsewhere.

## The Key to the Cow Simile

**‘Upamā kho me ayam, bhaginiyo, katā atthassa viññāpanāya,**  
‘This is a simile I have made, sisters, to instruct in the meaning,

**ayam-*evettha attho:***

and this is the meaning here:

**‘Antaro<sup>39</sup> maṃsakāyo,’ ti kho, bhaginiyo,**  
‘Flesh on the inside,’ sisters,

**channetaṃ ajjhattikānaṃ āyatanānaṃ adhivacanaṃ,**  
that is a designation for these six internal sense spheres,

**‘Bāhiro cammakāyo,’ ti kho bhaginiyo,**  
‘Hide on the outside,’ sisters,

**channetaṃ bāhirānaṃ āyatanānaṃ adhivacanaṃ,**  
that is a designation for these six external sense spheres,

**‘Antarā vilimaṃsaṃ, antarā nahāru, antarā bandhanan,’-ti kho, bhaginiyo,**  
‘The flesh stuck to the inside, the sinew on the inside, the teguments on the inside,’ sisters,

**nandirāgassetam<sup>40</sup> adhivacanaṃ,**  
that is a designation for enjoyment and passion,

**‘Tiṇhaṃ govikantanan,’-ti kho, bhaginiyo,**  
‘A sharp butcher’s knife,’ sisters,

**ariyāyetaṃ paññāya adhivacanaṃ,**  
that is a designation for noble wisdom,

**yāyaṃ ariyā paññā antarā kilesaṃ,**  
° the noble wisdom that cuts away the internal defilements,

**antarā saṃyojanaṃ, antarā bandhanaṃ sañchindati,**  
the internal fetters, the internal bonds,

**‘Antarākilesasaṃyojanabandhanan,’-ti sabbam antarākilesam-eva sandhāya vuttam.**  
‘The internal defilements, fetters and bonds,’ this was said in regard to all the internal defilements.

**saṅkantati samparikantati.**  
cuts them through, cuts them out.

---

<sup>39</sup> BJT, ChS: *Antarā*; which is not in agreement.

<sup>40</sup> ChS: *nandirāgassetam*, and similarly elsewhere.

## The Factors of Awakening

**Satta kho ime,<sup>41</sup> bhaginiyo, Bojjhaṅgā,**

There are these seven Factors of Awakening, sisters,<sup>42</sup>

**'Satta kho ime,' ti kasmā āhā ti?**

'There are these seven,' why was this said?

**'Yā hi esā paññā kilese chindatī,' ti vuttā,**

'For this wisdom cuts the defilements,' is said,

**sā na ekikā va attano dhammatāya chinditum sakkoti.**

(but) as a general rule it is not able to cut (them) by itself.

**Yathā pana kuṭhārī na attano dhammatāya chejjaṃ chindati,**

Just as an axe as a general rule cannot cut what can be cut by itself,

**purisassa tajaṃ vāyāmaṃ paṭiceva chindati,**

but on account of a man's endeavour it cuts,

**evam na vinā chahi Bojjhaṅgehi paññā kilese chinditum sakkoti.**

so without the other six Factors of Awakening wisdom<sup>43</sup> is not able to cut the defilements.

**Tasmā evam-āha.**

Therefore this was said.

**yesam bhāvitattā bahulikatattā,**

which when developed and made much of,

**bhikkhu āsavānaṃ khayā, anāsavaṃ, cetovimuttiṃ paññāvimuttiṃ,**

a monastic, through the destruction of the pollutants, without pollutants, freed in mind, freed through wisdom,

**diṭṭheva dhamme sayam abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja viharatī.**

dwells having known, having directly experienced, and having attained (Nibbāna) himself in this very life.

---

<sup>41</sup> BJT: *ime*, but *panime* in the repetition.

<sup>42</sup> Up till this point the nuns always say that they have previously understood the teachings, but not after this teaching, so it appears that this section about the seven Factors of Awakening is new to them, and it is through understanding this that they eventually (during the repetition) make the breakthrough.

<sup>43</sup> Wisdom here means *dhammavicaya*, *investigation (of the nature) of things*.

**Katame satta?**

Which seven?

**Idha, bhaginiyo, bhikkhu Satisambojjhaṅgaṃ bhāveti,**

Here, sisters, a monastic develops the Mindfulness Factor of Complete Awakening,

**vivekanissitaṃ virāganissitaṃ nirodhanissitaṃ vossaggapariṇāmiṃ,**

depending on solitude, depending on dispassion, depending on cessation, maturing in relinquishment,

**Dhammavicayasambojjhaṅgaṃ bhāveti,<sup>44</sup>**

develops the Investigation (of the Nature) of Things Factor of Complete Awakening,

**vivekanissitaṃ virāganissitaṃ nirodhanissitaṃ vossaggapariṇāmiṃ,**

depending on solitude, depending on dispassion, depending on cessation, maturing in relinquishment,

**Viriyasambojjhaṅgaṃ<sup>45</sup> bhāveti,**

develops the Energy Factor of Complete Awakening,

**vivekanissitaṃ virāganissitaṃ nirodhanissitaṃ vossaggapariṇāmiṃ,**

depending on solitude, depending on dispassion, depending on cessation, maturing in relinquishment,

**Pītisambojjhaṅgaṃ bhāveti,**

develops the Joy Factor of Complete Awakening,

**vivekanissitaṃ virāganissitaṃ nirodhanissitaṃ vossaggapariṇāmiṃ,**

depending on solitude, depending on dispassion, depending on cessation, maturing in relinquishment,

**Passaddhisambojjhaṅgaṃ bhāveti,**

develops the Tranquility Factor of Complete Awakening,

**vivekanissitaṃ virāganissitaṃ nirodhanissitaṃ vossaggapariṇāmiṃ,**

depending on solitude, depending on dispassion, depending on cessation, maturing in relinquishment,

**Samādhisambojjhaṅgaṃ bhāveti,**

develops the Concentration Factor of Complete Awakening,

**vivekanissitaṃ virāganissitaṃ nirodhanissitaṃ vossaggapariṇāmiṃ,**

depending on solitude, depending on dispassion, depending on cessation, maturing in relinquishment,

---

<sup>44</sup> PTS alone doesn't indicate elipsis here.

<sup>45</sup> ChS: *Vīriya*-; a form commonly found in the Burmese texts.

**Upekkhāsambojjhaṅgaṃ bhāveti,**

develops the Equanimity Factor of Complete Awakening,

**vivekanissitaṃ virāganissitaṃ nirodhanissitaṃ vossaggapariṇāmiṃ,**

depending on solitude, depending on dispassion, depending on cessation, maturing in relinquishment,

**Ime kho, bhaginiyo, satta Bojjhaṅgā,**

There are these seven Factors of Awakening, sisters,

**yesaṃ bhāvitattā bahulikatattā,**

which when developed and made much of,

**bhikkhu āsavānaṃ khayā, anāsavaṃ, cetovimuttiṃ paññāvimuttiṃ,**

a monastic, through the destruction of the pollutants, without pollutants, freed in mind, freed through wisdom,

**diṭṭheva dhamme sayaṃ abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja viharatī.” ti**

dwells having known, having directly experienced, and having attained (Nibbāna) himself in this very life.”

**Atha kho āyasmā Nandako tā bhikkhuniyo iminā ovādena ovaditvā uyyojesi:**

Then venerable Nandaka, having advised the nuns with this advice, sent them off,

**“Gacchatha, bhaginiyo, kālo.” ti**

saying: “Depart, sisters, it is time.”

### **The Fortunate One's Response**

**Atha kho tā bhikkhuniyo,**

Then those nuns,

**āyasmato Nandakassa bhāsitaṃ abhinanditvā anumoditvā,**

after rejoicing in and being gladdened by venerable Nandaka's speech,

**uṭṭhāyāsanā āyasmantaṃ Nandakaṃ abhivādetvā padakkhiṇaṃ katvā,**

rising from their seats, worshipping and circumambulating venerable Nandaka,

**yena Bhagavā tenupasaṅkamimsu,**

approached the Fortunate One,

**upasaṅkamtvā Bhagavantaṃ abhivādetvā ekam-antaṃ aṭṭhamsu.**

and after approaching and worshipping the Fortunate One, they stood on one side.

**Ekam-antaṃ ʒitā kho tā bhikkhuniyo Bhagavā etad-avoca:**

While they were standing on one side the Fortunate One said this to the nuns:

**“Gacchatha, bhikkhuniyo, kālo.” ti**

“Depart, sisters, it is time.”

**Atha kho tā bhikkhuniyo Bhagavantaṃ abhivādetvā**

Then those nuns, after worshipping

**padakkhiṇaṃ katvā, pakkamiṃsu.**

and circumambulating the Fortunate One, departed.

**Atha kho Bhagavā acirapakkantīsu<sup>46</sup> tāsu bhikkhunīsu bhikkhū āmantesi:**

Then, not long after those nuns had departed, the Fortunate One addressed the monks:

**“Seyyathā pi, bhikkhave, tad-ahuposathe cātuddase**

saying: “Just as, monks, on the Uposatha day of the fourteenth

**na hoti bahuno janassa kaṅkhā vā vimati vā:**

for most people there is no doubt or uncertainty:

**‘Ūno nu kho cando, puṇṇo nu kho cando?’ ti**

‘Is the moon deficient, or is the moon full?’

**atha kho ūno cando tveva hoti;**

for then the moon is deficient;

**evam-eva kho, bhikkhave, tā bhikkhuniyo<sup>47</sup>**

just so, monks, those nuns

**Nandakassa Dhammadesanāya attamaṇā ceva<sup>48</sup> honti,**

were uplifted by the venerable Nandaka's Dhamma preaching,

**no ca kho paripuṇṇasaṅkappā.” ti**

but their aspirations were not fulfilled.”

**Atha kho Bhagavā āyasmantaṃ Nandakaṃ āmantesi:**

Then the Fortunate One addressed the venerable Nandaka,

---

<sup>46</sup> RTE, PTS: *acirapakkantāsu*, alternative form.

<sup>47</sup> RTE omits: *bhikkhuniyo*.

<sup>48</sup> ChS omits: *ceva*.

**“Tena hi tvaṃ, Nandaka, sve pi tā bhikkhuniyo tenevovādena ovadeyyāsī.”** ti  
saying: “Nandaka, tomorrow also you should advise the nuns with just this advice.”

**‘Tena hī,’ ti yena kāraṇena tayā cha ajjhakkāni āyatanāni,**  
‘With ... this,’ with this reasoning on the six internal sense spheres,

**cha bāhirāni, cha viññāṇakāye,**  
the six external (sense spheres), the six kinds of consciousness,

**dīpopamaṃ, rukkhopamaṃ, gāvūpamaṃ-ca dassetvā,**  
instructing with the simile of the light, the simile of the tree, and the simile of the cow,

**sattahi Bojjhaṅgehi āsavakkhayena desanā niṭṭhapitā,**  
and concluding the teaching with the destruction of the pollutants through the seven Factors of Awakening,

**tena kāraṇena tvaṃ sve pi tā bhikkhuniyo teneva ovādena ovadeyyāsī. ti**  
with this reasoning you should advise the nuns tomorrow with this advice.

**“Evaṃ, Bhante,” ti kho āyasmā Nandako Bhagavato paccassosi.**  
“Very well, reverend Sir,” venerable Nandaka replied to the Fortunate One.

### The Following Day

**Atha kho āyasmā Nandako tassā rattiyā accayena pubbaṅhasamayaṃ nivāsetvā,**  
Then when the night had passed, venerable Nandaka, having dressed in the morning time,

**pattacīvaram-ādāya Sāvattthiṃ piṇḍāya pāvisi.**  
after picking up his bowl and robe, entered Sāvattthī for alms.

**Sāvattthiyaṃ piṇḍāya<sup>49</sup> caritvā, pacchābhattaṃ piṇḍapātaṇṇikkanto attadutiyo,**  
After walking for alms in Sāvattthī, and while returning from the alms-round with his attendant after the meal,

**yena Rājakārāmo tenupasaṅkamaṃ.**  
he approached the King's monastery.

**Addasaṃsu<sup>50</sup> kho tā bhikkhuniyo**  
The nuns saw

**āyasmantaṃ Nandakaṃ dūrato va āgacchantaṃ.**  
the venerable Nandaka coming while still far away,

**Disvāna āsanaṃ paññāpesuṃ, udakaṃ-ca pādānaṃ upaṭṭhapesuṃ.**  
and having seen (him), they prepared a seat, and had water set up for (washing) the feet.

<sup>49</sup> RTE omits *pāvisi. Sāvattthiyaṃ piṇḍāya.*

<sup>50</sup> All variations noted above need to be applied in the repetition also. Exceptions only are noted.

**Nisīdi kho āyasmā Nandako paññatte āsane, nisajja pāde pakkhālesi.**

Venerable Nandaka sat down on the prepared seat, and while sitting he washed his feet.

**Tā pi kho bhikkhuniyo āyasmantaṃ Nandakaṃ abhivādetvā,**

Those nuns worshipped venerable Nandaka

**ekam-antaṃ nisīdiṃsu.**

and sat down on one side.

**Ekam-antaṃ nisinnā kho tā bhikkhuniyo āyasmā Nandako etad-avoca:**

While sitting on one side venerable Nandaka said this to those nuns:

**“Paṭipucchakathā kho, bhaginiyo, bhavissati,**

“Sisters, this will be a talk in which I put questions,

**tattha ājānantīhi: ‘Ājānāmā,’ tissa vacanīyaṃ,**

herein, when you understand, you should say: ‘We understand,’

**na ājānantīhi: ‘Na ājānāmā,’ tissa vacanīyaṃ.**

when you don't understand, you should say: ‘We don't understand.’

**Yassā vā panassa kaṅkhā vā vimati vā aham-eva tattha paṭipucchitabbo:**

But if for you there is doubt or uncertainty herein you should ask in return:

**‘Idaṃ, Bhante, kathaṃ, imassa kvattho?’ ” ti**

‘This that you said, reverend Sir, what is its meaning?’ ”

**“Ettakena pi mayaṃ, Bhante, ayyassa Nandakassa attamanā abhiraddhā,**

“So far, reverend Sir, we are uplifted and satisfied with the noble Nandaka,

**yaṃ no ayyo Nandako pavāretī.” ti**

and for the noble Nandaka making this invitation to us.”



## The Instruction on the Internal Sense Spheres

**“Taṃ kiṃ maññaṭha, bhaginiyo, cakkhuṃ niccaṃ vā aniccaṃ vā?” ti**  
“What do you think of this, sisters, is the eye permanent or impermanent?”<sup>51</sup>

**“Aniccaṃ, Bhante.”**  
“Impermanent, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ panāniccaṃ<sup>52</sup> dukkhaṃ vā taṃ sukhaṃ vā?” ti**  
“But that which is impermanent, is that unpleasant or pleasant?”

**“Dukkhaṃ, Bhante.”**  
“Unpleasant, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**  
“But that which is unpleasant and changeable,

**kallaṃ nu taṃ samanupassituṃ:**  
is it proper to regard it thus:

**“Etaṃ mama, esoham-asmi, eso me Attā?” ti**  
“This is mine, this I am, this is my Self?”

**“No hetāṃ, Bhante.”**  
“Certainly not, reverend Sir.”

**“Taṃ kiṃ maññaṭha, bhaginiyo, sotaṃ niccaṃ vā aniccaṃ vā?” ti**  
“What do you think of this, sisters, is the ear permanent or impermanent?”

**“Aniccaṃ, Bhante.”**  
“Impermanent, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vā taṃ sukhaṃ vā?” ti**  
“But that which is impermanent, is that unpleasant or pleasant?”

**“Dukkhaṃ, Bhante.”**  
“Unpleasant, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**  
“But that which is unpleasant and changeable,

---

<sup>51</sup> It is rather odd that he repeats this same instruction when the nuns already told him they had understood all this previously.

<sup>52</sup> At this point PTS gives instructions as to how to fill in the lacuna, and continues: *Gacchattha, bhikkhuniyo; kālo ti*. Other versions print the repetition in full.

**kallaṃ nu taṃ samanupassituṃ:**

is it proper to regard it thus:

**“Etaṃ mama, esoham-asmi, eso me Attā?” ” ti**

“This is mine, this I am, this is my Self?” ”

**“No hetam, Bhante.”**

“Certainly not, reverend Sir.”

**“Taṃ kiṃ maññatha, bhaginiyo, ghānaṃ niccaṃ vā aniccaṃ vā?” ti**

“What do you think of this, sisters, **is the nose permanent or impermanent?**”

**“Aniccaṃ, Bhante.”**

“Impermanent, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vā taṃ sukhaṃ vā?” ti**

“But that which is impermanent, is that unpleasant or pleasant?”

**“Dukkhaṃ, Bhante.”**

“Unpleasant, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**

“But that which is unpleasant and changeable,

**kallaṃ nu taṃ samanupassituṃ:**

is it proper to regard it thus:

**“Etaṃ mama, esoham-asmi, eso me Attā?” ” ti**

“This is mine, this I am, this is my Self?” ”

**“No hetam, Bhante.”**

“Certainly not, reverend Sir.”

**“Taṃ kiṃ maññatha, bhaginiyo, jivhā niccā vā aniccā vā?” ti**

“What do you think of this, sisters, **is the tongue permanent or impermanent?**”

**“Aniccā, Bhante.”**

“Impermanent, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vā taṃ sukhaṃ vā?” ti**

“But that which is impermanent, is that unpleasant or pleasant?”

**“Dukkhaṃ, Bhante.”**

“Unpleasant, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**

“But that which is unpleasant and changeable,

**kallaṃ nu taṃ samanupassituṃ:**

is it proper to regard it thus:

**“Etaṃ mama, esoham-asmi, eso me Attā?” ” ti**

“This is mine, this I am, this is my Self?” ”

**“No hetāṃ, Bhante.”**

“Certainly not, reverend Sir.”

**“Taṃ kiṃ maññatha, bhaginiyo, kāyo nicco vā anicco vā?” ti**

“What do you think of this, sisters, **is the body permanent or impermanent?**”

**“Anicco, Bhante.”**

“Impermanent, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vā taṃ sukhaṃ vā?” ti**

“But that which is impermanent, is that unpleasant or pleasant?”

**“Dukkhaṃ, Bhante.”**

“Unpleasant, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**

“But that which is unpleasant and changeable,

**kallaṃ nu taṃ samanupassituṃ:**

is it proper to regard it thus:

**“Etaṃ mama, esoham-asmi, eso me Attā?” ” ti**

“This is mine, this I am, this is my Self?” ”

**“No hetāṃ, Bhante.”**

“Certainly not, reverend Sir.”

**“Taṃ kiṃ maññatha, bhaginiyo, mano nicco vā anicco vā?” ti**

“What do you think of this, sisters, **is the mind permanent or impermanent?**”

**“Anicco, Bhante.”**

“Impermanent, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vā taṃ sukhaṃ vā?” ti**

“But that which is impermanent, is that unpleasant or pleasant?”

**“Dukkhaṃ, Bhante.”**

“Unpleasant, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**

“But that which is unpleasant and changeable,

**kallaṃ nu taṃ samanupassitum:**

is it proper to regard it thus:

**‘Etaṃ mama, esoham-asmi, eso me Attā?’” ti**

“This is mine, this I am, this is my Self?”

**“No hetam, Bhante.**

“Certainly not, reverend Sir.

**Taṃ kissa hetu?**

What is the reason for that?

**Pubbe va no hetam, Bhante, yathābhūtaṃ sammappaññāya sudiṭṭham:**

Previously, reverend Sir, this was well seen by us, as it really is, with perfect wisdom:

**‘Iti pi me cha ajjhattikā āyatanā aniccā.’” ti**

“These six internal sense spheres are impermanent.”

**“Sādhu, sādhu, bhaginiyo!**

“Very good, very good, sisters!

**Evaṃ hetam, bhaginiyo,**

This is the way, sisters,

**hoti ariyasāvakaṃ yathābhūtaṃ sammappaññāya passato.**

for a noble disciple who sees it as it really is, with perfect wisdom.

### **The Instruction on the External Sense Spheres**

**Taṃ kiṃ maññatha, bhaginiyo, rūpā niccā vā aniccā vā” ti?**

What do you think of this, sisters, are forms permanent or impermanent?”

**“Aniccā, Bhante.”**

“Impermanent, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vā taṃ sukhaṃ vā?” ti**

“But that which is impermanent, is that unpleasant or pleasant?”

**“Dukkhaṃ, Bhante.”**

“Unpleasant, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**

“But that which is unpleasant and changeable,

**kallaṃ nu taṃ samanupassitum:**

is it proper to regard it thus:

**‘Etaṃ mama, esoham-asmi, eso me Attā?’ ” ti**

“This is mine, this I am, this is my Self?” ”

**“No hetam, Bhante.”**

“Certainly not, reverend Sir.”

**‘Taṃ kiṃ maññatha, bhaginiyo, saddā niccā vā aniccā vā?’ ” ti**

“What do you think of this, sisters, are sounds permanent or impermanent?”

**“Aniccā, Bhante.”**

“Impermanent, reverend Sir.”

**‘Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vā taṃ sukhaṃ vā?’ ” ti**

“But that which is impermanent, is that unpleasant or pleasant?”

**“Dukkhaṃ, Bhante.”**

“Unpleasant, reverend Sir.”

**‘Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**

“But that which is unpleasant and changeable,

**kallaṃ nu taṃ samanupassituṃ:**

is it proper to regard it thus:

**‘Etaṃ mama, esoham-asmi, eso me Attā?’ ” ti**

“This is mine, this I am, this is my Self?” ”

**“No hetam, Bhante.”**

“Certainly not, reverend Sir.”

**‘Taṃ kiṃ maññatha, bhaginiyo, gandhā niccā vā aniccā vā?’ ” ti**

“What do you think of this, sisters, are smells permanent or impermanent?”

**“Aniccā, Bhante.”**

“Impermanent, reverend Sir.”

**‘Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vā taṃ sukhaṃ vā?’ ” ti**

“But that which is impermanent, is that unpleasant or pleasant?”

**“Dukkhaṃ, Bhante.”**

“Unpleasant, reverend Sir.”

**‘Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**

“But that which is unpleasant and changeable,

**kallaṃ nu taṃ samanupassituṃ:**

is it proper to regard it thus:

**‘Etaṃ mama, esoham-asmi, eso me Attā?’ ” ti**

“This is mine, this I am, this is my Self?” ”

**“No hetāṃ, Bhante.”**

“Certainly not, reverend Sir.”

**‘Taṃ kiṃ maññatha, bhaginiyo, rasā niccā vā aniccā vā?’ ti**

“What do you think of this, sisters, are tastes permanent or impermanent?”

**“Aniccā, Bhante.”**

“Impermanent, reverend Sir.”

**‘Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vā taṃ sukhaṃ vā?’ ti**

“But that which is impermanent, is that unpleasant or pleasant?”

**“Dukkhaṃ, Bhante.”**

“Unpleasant, reverend Sir.”

**‘Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**

“But that which is unpleasant and changeable,

**kallaṃ nu taṃ samanupassituṃ:**

is it proper to regard it thus:

**‘Etaṃ mama, esoham-asmi, eso me Attā?’ ” ti**

“This is mine, this I am, this is my Self?” ”

**“No hetāṃ, Bhante.”**

“Certainly not, reverend Sir.”

**‘Taṃ kiṃ maññatha, bhaginiyo, phoṭṭhabbā niccā vā aniccā vā?’ ti**

“What do you think of this, sisters, are touches permanent or impermanent?”

**“Aniccā, Bhante.”**

“Impermanent, reverend Sir.”

**‘Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vā taṃ sukhaṃ vā?’ ti**

“But that which is impermanent, is that unpleasant or pleasant?”

**“Dukkhaṃ, Bhante.”**

“Unpleasant, reverend Sir.”

**‘Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**

“But that which is unpleasant and changeable,

**kallaṃ nu taṃ samanupassituṃ:**

is it proper to regard it thus:

**‘Etaṃ mama, esoham-asmi, eso me Attā?’ ” ti**  
“This is mine, this I am, this is my Self? ”

**“No hetam, Bhante.”**  
“Certainly not, reverend Sir.”

**“Taṃ kiṃ maññatha, bhaginiyo, dhammā niccā vā aniccā vā?” ti**  
“What do you think of this, sisters, are thoughts permanent or impermanent?”

**“Aniccā, Bhante.”**  
“Impermanent, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ panāniccam dukkham vā taṃ sukham vā?” ti**  
“But that which is impermanent, is that unpleasant or pleasant?”

**“Dukkham, Bhante.”**  
“Unpleasant, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ panāniccam dukkham vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**  
“But that which is unpleasant and changeable,

**kallaṃ nu taṃ samanupassituṃ:**  
is it proper to regard it thus:

**‘Etaṃ mama, esoham-asmi, eso me Attā?’ ” ti**  
“This is mine, this I am, this is my Self? ”

**“No hetam, Bhante.**  
“Certainly not, reverend Sir.

**Taṃ kissa hetu?**  
What is the reason for that?

**Pubbe va no hetam, Bhante, yathābhūtaṃ sammappaññāya sudiṭṭham:**  
Previously, reverend Sir, this was well seen by us, as it really is, with perfect wisdom:

**‘Iti pi me cha bāhirā āyatanā aniccā.’ ” ti**  
“These six external sense spheres are impermanent.’ ”

**“Sādhu, sādhu, bhaginiyo!**  
“Very good, very good, sisters!

**Evam hetam, bhaginiyo,**  
This is the way, sisters,

**hoti ariyasāvakaṃ yathābhūtaṃ sammappaññāya passato.**  
for a noble disciple who sees it as it really is, with perfect wisdom.

## The Instruction on the Six Consciousnesses

**Taṃ kiṃ maññatha, bhaginiyo, cakkhuviññāṇaṃ niccaṃ vā aniccaṃ vā?” ti**  
What do you think of this, sisters, is eye-consciousness permanent or impermanent?”

**“Aniccaṃ, Bhante.”**

“Impermanent, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vā taṃ sukhaṃ vā?” ti**  
“But that which is impermanent, is that unpleasant or pleasant?”

**“Dukkhaṃ, Bhante.”**

“Unpleasant, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**  
“But that which is unpleasant and changeable,

**kallaṃ nu taṃ samanupassituṃ:**  
is it proper to regard it thus:

**‘Etaṃ mama, esoham-asmi, eso me Attā?’ ” ti**  
“This is mine, this I am, this is my Self? ”

**“No hetāṃ, Bhante.”<sup>53</sup>**

“Certainly not, reverend Sir.”

**“Taṃ kiṃ maññatha, bhaginiyo, sotaviññāṇaṃ niccaṃ vā aniccaṃ vā?” ti**  
“What do you think of this, sisters, is ear-consciousness permanent or impermanent?”

**“Aniccaṃ, Bhante.”**

“Impermanent, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vā taṃ sukhaṃ vā?” ti**  
“But that which is impermanent, is that unpleasant or pleasant?”

**“Dukkhaṃ, Bhante.”**

“Unpleasant, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**  
“But that which is unpleasant and changeable,

---

<sup>53</sup> RTE mistakenly adds the whole end sequence here, before it has even run through the variant consciousnesses. It includes it at the end also, in its proper place.



**kallaṃ nu taṃ samanupassituṃ:**

is it proper to regard it thus:

**“Etaṃ mama, esoḥam-asmi, eso me Attā?” ” ti**

“This is mine, this I am, this is my Self?” ”

**“No hetāṃ, Bhante.”**

“Certainly not, reverend Sir.”

**“Taṃ kiṃ maññaṭṭha, bhaginiyo, ghānaviññaṇaṃ niccaṃ vā aniccaṃ vā?” ti**

“What do you think of this, sisters, **is nose-consciousness permanent or impermanent?**”

**“Aniccaṃ, Bhante.”**

“Impermanent, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vā taṃ sukhaṃ vā?” ti**

“But that which is impermanent, is that unpleasant or pleasant?”

**“Dukkhaṃ, Bhante.”**

“Unpleasant, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**

“But that which is unpleasant and changeable,

**kallaṃ nu taṃ samanupassituṃ:**

is it proper to regard it thus:

**“Etaṃ mama, esoḥam-asmi, eso me Attā?” ” ti**

“This is mine, this I am, this is my Self?” ”

**“No hetāṃ, Bhante.”**

“Certainly not, reverend Sir.”

**“Taṃ kiṃ maññaṭṭha, bhaginiyo, jivhāviññaṇaṃ niccaṃ vā aniccaṃ vā?” ti**

“What do you think of this, sisters, **is tongue-consciousness permanent or impermanent?**”

**“Aniccaṃ, Bhante.”**

“Impermanent, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vā taṃ sukhaṃ vā?” ti**

“But that which is impermanent, is that unpleasant or pleasant?”

**“Dukkhaṃ, Bhante.”**

“Unpleasant, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**

“But that which is unpleasant and changeable,

**kallaṃ nu taṃ samanupassituṃ:**

is it proper to regard it thus:

**“Etaṃ mama, esoham-asmi, eso me Attā?” ” ti**

“This is mine, this I am, this is my Self?” ”

**“No hetam, Bhante.”**

“Certainly not, reverend Sir.”

**“Taṃ kiṃ maññatha, bhaginiyo, kāyaviññāṇaṃ niccaṃ vā aniccaṃ vā?” ti**

“What do you think of this, sisters, is body-consciousness permanent or impermanent?”

**“Aniccaṃ, Bhante.”**

“Impermanent, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vā taṃ sukhaṃ vā?” ti**

“But that which is impermanent, is that unpleasant or pleasant?”

**“Dukkhaṃ, Bhante.”**

“Unpleasant, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**

“But that which is unpleasant and changeable,

**kallaṃ nu taṃ samanupassituṃ:**

is it proper to regard it thus:

**“Etaṃ mama, esoham-asmi, eso me Attā?” ” ti**

“This is mine, this I am, this is my Self?” ”

**“No hetam, Bhante.”**

“Certainly not, reverend Sir.”

**“Taṃ kiṃ maññatha, bhaginiyo, manoviññāṇaṃ niccaṃ vā aniccaṃ vā?” ti**

“What do you think of this, sisters, is mind-consciousness permanent or impermanent?”

**“Aniccaṃ, Bhante.”**

“Impermanent, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vā taṃ sukhaṃ vā?” ti**

“But that which is impermanent, is that unpleasant or pleasant?”

**“Dukkhaṃ, Bhante.”**

“Unpleasant, reverend Sir.”

**“Yaṃ panāniccaṃ dukkhaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**

“But that which is unpleasant and changeable,

**kallaṃ nu taṃ samanupassitum:**

is it proper to regard it thus:

**‘Etaṃ mama, esoham-asmi, eso me Attā?’ ” ti**

‘This is mine, this I am, this is my Self?’ ”

**‘No hetam, Bhante.**

‘Certainly not, reverend Sir.

**Tam kissa hetu?**

What is the reason for that?

**Pubbe va no hetam, Bhante, yathābhūtam sammappaññāya sudiṭṭham:**

Previously, reverend Sir, this was well seen by us, as it really is, with perfect wisdom:

**‘Iti pi me cha viññāṇakāyā aniccā.’ ” ti**

‘These six kinds of consciousness are impermanent.’ ”

**‘Sādhu, sādhu, bhaginiyo!**

‘Very good, very good, sisters!

**Evaṃ hetam, bhaginiyo,**

This is the way, sisters,

**hoti ariyasāvakaṃ yathābhūtam sammappaññāya passato.**

for a noble disciple who sees it as it really is, with perfect wisdom.

### **The Oil Lamp Simile**

**Seyyathā pi, bhaginiyo, telappadīpassa jhāyato,**

Suppose, sisters, when an oil lamp is burning

**telam-pi aniccaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**

the oil is impermanent and changeable,

**vaṭṭi pi aniccā vipariṇāmadhammā,**

the wick is impermanent and changeable,

**acci pi aniccā vipariṇāmadhammā,**

the flame is impermanent and changeable,

**ābhā pi aniccā vipariṇāmadhammā.**

the radiance is impermanent and changeable.

**Yo nu kho, bhaginiyo, evaṃ vadeyya:**

He who would say this, sisters:

**‘Amussa telappadīpassa jhāyato, telam-pi aniccaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**  
‘For this oil lamp that is burning the oil is impermanent and changeable,

**vaṭṭi pi aniccā vipariṇāmadhammā,**  
the wick is impermanent and changeable,

**acci pi aniccā vipariṇāmadhammā,**  
the flame is impermanent and changeable,

**yā ca<sup>54</sup> khvāssa ābhā sā niccā dhuvā sassatā avipariṇāmadhammā,’ ti**  
but the radiance is permanent, constant, eternal and unchangeable,’

**sammā nu kho so, bhaginiyo, vadamāno vadeyyā?’ ti**  
would someone speaking in this way, sisters, be speaking correctly?’

**‘No hetam, Bhante.**  
‘Certainly not, reverend Sir.

**Tam kissa hetu?**  
What is the reason for that?

**Amussa hi, Bhante, telappadīpassa jhāyato,**  
For while this oil lamp is burning, reverend Sir,

**telam-pi aniccaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**  
the oil is impermanent and changeable,

**vaṭṭi pi aniccā vipariṇāmadhammā,**  
the wick is impermanent and changeable,

**acci pi aniccā vipariṇāmadhammā,**  
the flame is impermanent and changeable,

**pagevassa ābhā aniccā vipariṇāmadhammā?’ ti**  
then what to say of its radiance being impermanent and changeable?’

**‘Evam-eva kho, bhaginiyo, yo nu kho evam vadeyya:**  
‘Just so he who would say this, sisters:

**‘Cha kho me ajjhattikā āyatanā aniccā,**  
‘These six internal sense-spheres are impermanent,

---

<sup>54</sup> BJT omits: *ca* here, but includes it in similar places elsewhere.

**yañ-ca kho cha ajjhattike āyatane paṭicca,**  
but that which is conditioned by these six internal sense-spheres,

**paṭisaṃvedeti sukhaṃ vā dukkhaṃ vā adukkhamasukhaṃ vā,**  
the pleasant or painful or neither painful-nor-pleasant (feeling) that he feels,

**taṃ niccaṃ dhuvam̐ sassatam̐ avipariṇāmadhamman,'-ti**  
that is permanent, constant, eternal and unchangeable,'

**sammā nu kho so, bhaginiyo, vadamāno vadeyyā?" ti**  
would someone speaking in this way, sisters, be speaking correctly?"

**"No hetam̐, Bhante.**  
"Certainly not, reverend Sir.

**Tam̐ kissa hetu?**  
What is the reason for that?

**Tajjam̐ tajjam̐, Bhante, paccayam̐ paṭicca,**  
Whatever arises, reverend Sir, is conditioned by conditions,

**tajjā tajjā vedanā uppajjanti.**  
and with that arising feelings appear.

**Tajjassa tajjassa paccayassa nirodhā,**  
With the cessation of the conditions for whatever arises,

**tajjā tajjā vedanā nirujjhantī." ti**  
whatever feelings have arisen cease."

**"Sādhu, sādhu, bhaginiyo!**  
"Very good, very good, sisters!

**Evam̐ hetam̐, bhaginiyo,**  
This is the way, sisters,

**hoti ariyasāvakaassa yathābhūtam̐ sammappaññāya passato.**  
for a noble disciple who sees it as it really is, with perfect wisdom.

## The Big Tree Simile

**Seyyathā pi, bhaginiyo, mahato rukkhassa tiṭṭhato sāravato,**

Suppose, sisters, when there is a big tree standing, having heartwood,

**mūlam-pi aniccaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**

the root is impermanent and changeable,

**khandho pi anicco vipariṇāmadhammo,**

the trunk is impermanent and changeable,

**sākhāpalāsam-pi aniccaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**

the branches and foilage are impermanent and changeable,

**chāyā pi aniccā vipariṇāmadhammā.**

the shadow is impermanent and changeable.

**Yo nu kho, bhaginiyo, evaṃ vadeyya:**

He who would say this, sisters:

**‘Amussa mahato rukkhassa tiṭṭhato sāravato,**

‘For this big tree which is stood here, having heartwood,

**mūlam-pi aniccaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**

the root is impermanent and changeable,

**khandho pi anicco vipariṇāmadhammo,**

the trunk is impermanent and changeable,

**sākhāpalāsam-pi aniccaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**

the branches and foilage are impermanent and changeable,

**yā ca khvāssa chāyā sā niccā dhuvā sassatā avipariṇāmadhammā,’ ti**

but the shadow is permanent, constant, eternal and unchangeable,’

**sammā nu kho so, bhaginiyo, vadamāno vadeyyā?’ ti**

would someone speaking in this way, sisters, be speaking correctly?’

**“No hetam, Bhante.**

“Certainly not, reverend Sir.

**Tam kissa hetu?**

What is the reason for that?

**Amussa hi, Bhante, mahato rukkhassa tiṭṭhato sāravato,**

For this big tree which is stood here, reverend Sir, having heartwood,

**mūlam-pi aniccaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**  
the root is impermanent and changeable,

**khandho pi anicco vipariṇāmadhammo,**  
the trunk is impermanent and changeable,

**sākhāpalāsam-pi aniccaṃ vipariṇāmadhammaṃ,**  
the branches and foilage are impermanent and changeable,

**pagevassa chāyā aniccā vipariṇāmadhammā?" ti**  
then what to say of its shadow being impermanent and changeable?"

**"Evaṃ-eva kho, bhaginiyo, yo nu kho evaṃ vadeyya:**  
"Just so he who would say this, sisters:

**'Cha kho me bāhirā āyatanā aniccā,**  
'These six external sense-spheres are impermanent,

**yañ-ca kho cha bāhire āyatane paṭicca**  
but that which is conditioned by these six external sense-spheres

**paṭisaṃvedeti sukhaṃ vā dukkhaṃ vā adukkhamasukhaṃ vā,**  
the pleasant or painful or neither painful-nor-pleasant (feeling) that he feels,

**taṃ niccaṃ dhuvaṃ sassataṃ avipariṇāmadhammaṃ,'-ti**  
that is permanent, constant, eternal and unchangeable,'

**sammā nu kho so, bhaginiyo, vadamāno vadeyyā?" ti**  
would someone speaking in this way, sisters, be speaking correctly?"

**"No hetuṃ, Bhante.**  
"Certainly not, reverend Sir.

**Taṃ kissa hetu?**  
What is the reason for that?

**Tajjaṃ tajjaṃ, Bhante, paccayaṃ paṭicca,**  
Whatever arises, reverend Sir, is conditioned by conditions,

**tajjā tajjā vedanā uppajjanti.**  
and with that arising feelings appear.

**Tajjassa tajjassa paccayassa<sup>55</sup> nirodhā,**  
With the cessation of the conditions for whatever arises,

---

<sup>55</sup> RTE: *paccassa*, here, by mistake.

**tajjā tajjā vedanā nirujjhantī.” ti**  
whatever feelings have arisen cease.”

**“Sādhu, sādhu, bhaginiyo!**  
“Very good, very good, sisters!

**Evam hetam, bhaginiyo, hoti ariyasāvakassa**  
This is the way, sisters, for a noble disciple

**yathābhūtam sammappaññāya passato.**  
who sees it as it really is, with perfect wisdom.

### The Cow Simile

**Seyyathā pi, bhaginiyo,**  
Suppose, sisters,

**dakkho goghātako vā goghātakantevāsī vā, gāvim vadhitvā,**  
a butcher or a butcher's apprentice, after killing a cow,

**tiṭhena govikantanena gāvim vikanteyya,**  
were to cut through the cow with a sharp butcher's knife,

**anupahacca<sup>56</sup> antaram maṃsakāyaṃ, anupahacca bāhiram cammakāyaṃ,**  
without harming the flesh on the inside, and without harming the hide on the outside,

**yaṃ yad-eva tattha, antarā vilimaṃsam, antarā nahāru, antarā bandhanam,**  
(but) whatever was right there, the flesh stuck to the inside, the sinew on the inside, the teguments on the inside,

**taṃ tad-eva tiṭhena govikantanena sañchindeyya,**  
(all) that he were to cut away from the cow with a sharp butcher's knife,

**saṅkanteyya samparikanteyya,**  
were to cut it through, were to cut it out,

**sañchinditvā saṅkantitvā samparikantitvā,**  
and after having cut it away, cut it through, cut it out,

**vidhunitvā bāhiram cammakāyaṃ,**  
and removed the hide on the outside,

---

<sup>56</sup> RTE spells *anūpahacca*, here, but *anupahacca* in the first section above.



**teneva cammena taṃ gāviṃ paṭicchādetvā evaṃ vadeyya:**

and with the hide having covered that cow (again), were he to say thus:

**‘Tathevāyaṃ gāvī saṃyuttā iminā va<sup>57</sup> cammenā,’ ti**

‘This cow is connected with its hide (again),’

**sammā nu kho so, bhaginiyo, vadamāno vadeyyā?’ ti**

would someone speaking in this way, sisters, be speaking correctly?’

**‘No hetam, Bhante.**

‘Certainly not, reverend Sir.

**Taṃ kissa hetu?**

What is the reason for that?

**Amu hi, Bhante, dakkho goghātako vā goghātakantevāsī vā, gāviṃ vadhitvā,**

For, reverend Sir, (if) a butcher or a butcher's apprentice, after killing a cow,

**tiṅhena govikantanena gāviṃ vikanteyya,**

were to cut through the cow with a sharp butcher's knife,

**anupahacca antaram maṃsakāyaṃ, anupahacca bāhiram cammakāyaṃ,**

without harming the flesh on the inside, and without harming the hide on the outside,

**yaṃ yad-eva tattha, antarā vilimaṃsaṃ, antarā nahāru, antarā bandhanam,**

and whatever was right there, the flesh stuck to the inside, the sinew on the inside, the teguments on the inside,

**taṃ tad-eva tiṅhena govikantanena sañchindeyya,**

(all) that he were to cut away from the cow with a sharp butcher's knife,

**saṅkanteyya samparikanteyya,**

were to cut it through, were to cut it out,

**sañchinditvā saṅkantitvā samparikantitvā,**

and after having cut it away, cut it through, cut it out,

**vidhunitvā bāhiram cammakāyaṃ,**

and removed the hide on the outside,

**teneva cammena taṃ gāviṃ paṭicchādetvā, kiñcāpi so evaṃ vadeyya:**

and with the hide having covered that cow (again), were he to say thus:

---

<sup>57</sup> BJT omits *va* in the repetition.

**‘Tathevāyaṃ gāvī saṃyuttā iminā va cammenā,’ ti**  
‘This cow is connected with its hide (again),’

**atha kho sā gāvī visāyuttā teneva cammenā.” ti**  
still that cow would not be connected with its hide (again).”

### **The Key to the Cow Simile**

**‘Upamā kho me ayam, bhaginiyo, katā atthassa viññāpanāya,**  
“This is a simile I have made, sisters, to instruct in the meaning,

**ayam-evettha attho:**  
and this is the meaning here:

**‘Antarā maṃsakāyo,’ ti kho, bhaginiyo,**  
‘Flesh on the inside,’ sisters,

**channetaṃ ajjhattikānaṃ āyatanānaṃ adhivacanaṃ,**  
that is a designation for these six internal sense spheres,

**‘Bāhiro cammakāyo,’ ti kho bhaginiyo,**  
‘Hide on the outside,’ sisters,

**channetaṃ bāhirānaṃ āyatanānaṃ adhivacanaṃ,**  
that is a designation for these six external sense spheres,

**‘Antarā vilimaṃsaṃ, antarā nahāru, antarā bandhanan,’-ti kho, bhaginiyo,**  
‘The flesh stuck to the inside, the sinew on the inside, the teguments on the inside,’ sisters,

**nandirāgassetam adhivacanaṃ,**  
that is a designation for enjoyment and passion,

**‘Tiṅhaṃ govikantanan,’-ti kho, bhaginiyo,**  
‘A sharp butcher’s knife,’ sisters,

**ariyāyetaṃ paññāya adhivacanaṃ,**  
that is a designation for noble wisdom,

**yāyaṃ ariyā paññā antarā kilesaṃ,**  
° the noble wisdom that cuts away the internal defilements,

**antarā saṃyojanaṃ, antarā bandhanaṃ sañchindati,**  
the internal fetters, the internal bonds,

**saṅkantati samparikantati.**  
cuts them through, cuts them out.

## The Factors of Awakening

**Satta kho panime,<sup>58</sup> bhaginiyo, Bojjhaṅgā,**  
There are these seven Factors of Awakening, sisters,

**yesam bhāvitattā bahulikatattā,**  
which when developed and made much of,

**bhikkhu āsavānaṃ khayā, anāsavaṃ, cetovimuttiṃ paññāvimuttiṃ,**  
a monastic, through the destruction of the pollutants, without pollutants, freed in mind,  
freed through wisdom,

**diṭṭheva dhamme sayam abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja viharati.**  
dwells having known, having directly experienced, and having attained (Nibbāna) himself  
in this very life.

**Katame satta?**  
Which seven?

**Idha, bhaginiyo, bhikkhu Satisambojjhaṅgaṃ bhāveti,**  
Here, sisters, a monastic develops the Mindfulness Factor of Complete Awakening,

**vivekanissitaṃ virāganissitaṃ nirodhanissitaṃ vossaggapariṇāmiṃ,**  
depending on solitude, depending on dispassion, depending on cessation, maturing in  
relinquishment,

**Dhammavicayasambojjhaṅgaṃ bhāveti,**  
develops the Investigation (of the Nature) of Things Factor of Complete Awakening,

**vivekanissitaṃ virāganissitaṃ nirodhanissitaṃ vossaggapariṇāmiṃ,**  
depending on solitude, depending on dispassion, depending on cessation, maturing in  
relinquishment,

**Viriyasambojjhaṅgaṃ bhāveti,**  
develops the Energy Factor of Complete Awakening,

**vivekanissitaṃ virāganissitaṃ nirodhanissitaṃ vossaggapariṇāmiṃ,**  
depending on solitude, depending on dispassion, depending on cessation, maturing in  
relinquishment,

**Pītisambojjhaṅgaṃ bhāveti,**  
develops the Joy Factor of Complete Awakening,

---

<sup>58</sup> RTE here: *Satta kho ime*, but *panime* elsewhere.

**vivekanissitaṃ virāganissitaṃ nirodhanissitaṃ vossaggapariṇāmiṃ,**  
depending on solitude, depending on dispassion, depending on cessation, maturing in  
relinquishment,

**Passaddhisambojjhaṅgaṃ bhāveti,**  
develops the Tranquility Factor of Complete Awakening,

**vivekanissitaṃ virāganissitaṃ nirodhanissitaṃ vossaggapariṇāmiṃ,**  
depending on solitude, depending on dispassion, depending on cessation, maturing in  
relinquishment,

**Samādhisambojjhaṅgaṃ bhāveti,**  
develops the Concentration Factor of Complete Awakening,

**vivekanissitaṃ virāganissitaṃ nirodhanissitaṃ vossaggapariṇāmiṃ,**  
depending on solitude, depending on dispassion, depending on cessation, maturing in  
relinquishment,

**Upekkhāsambojjhaṅgaṃ bhāveti,**  
develops the Equanimity Factor of Complete Awakening,

**vivekanissitaṃ virāganissitaṃ nirodhanissitaṃ vossaggapariṇāmiṃ,**  
depending on solitude, depending on dispassion, depending on cessation, maturing in  
relinquishment,

**Ime kho, bhaginiyo, satta Bojjhaṅgā,**  
There are these seven Factors of Awakening, sisters,

**yesaṃ bhāvitattā bahulikatattā,**  
which when developed and made much of,

**bhikkhu āsavānaṃ khayā, anāsavaṃ, cetovimuttiṃ paññāvimuttiṃ,**  
a monastic, through the destruction of the pollutants, without pollutants, freed in mind,  
freed through wisdom,

**diṭṭheva dhamme sayam abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja viharatī.” ti**  
dwells having known, having directly experienced, and having attained (Nibbāna) himself  
in this very life.”

**Atha kho āyasmā Nandako tā bhikkhuniyo iminā ovādena ovaditvā uyyojesi:**  
Then venerable Nandaka, having advised the nuns with this advice, sent them off,

**“Gacchatha, bhaginiyo, kālo.” ti**  
saying: “Depart, sisters, it is time.”

## The Fortunate One's Response

**Atha kho tā bhikkhuniyo**

Then those nuns

**āyasmato Nandakassa bhāsitaṃ abhinanditvā anumoditvā,**

after rejoicing in and being gladdened by venerable Nandaka's speech,

**uṭṭhāyāsanā āyasmantaṃ Nandakaṃ abhivādetvā padakkhiṇaṃ katvā,**

rising from their seats, worshipping and circumambulating venerable Nandaka,

**yena Bhagavā tenupasaṅkamimsu,**

approached the Fortunate One,

**upasaṅkamitvā Bhagavantaṃ abhivādetvā ekam-antaṃ aṭṭhamsu.**

and after approaching and worshipping the Fortunate One, they stood on one side.

**Ekam-antaṃ ʈhitā kho tā bhikkhuniyo Bhagavā etad-avoca:**

While they were standing on one side the Fortunate One said this to the nuns:

**“Gacchatha, bhikkhuniyo, kālo.” ti**

“Depart, sisters, it is time.”

**Atha kho tā bhikkhuniyo Bhagavantaṃ abhivādetvā**

Then those nuns, after worshipping

**padakkhiṇaṃ katvā, pakkamimsu.**

and circumambulating the Fortunate One, departed.

**Atha kho Bhagavā acirapakkantīsu tāsu bhikkhunīsu bhikkhū āmantesi:**

Then, not long after those nuns had departed, the Fortunate One addressed the monks:

**“Seyyathā pi, bhikkhave, tad-ahuposathe pannarase**

saying: “Just as, monks, on the Uposatha day of the fifteenth

**na hoti bahuno janassa kaṅkhā vā vimati vā:**

for most people there is no doubt or uncertainty:

**‘Ūno nu kho cando, puṇṇo nu kho cando?’ ti**

‘Is the moon deficient, or is the moon full?’

**atha kho puṇṇo cando tveva hoti;**

for then the moon is full;

**evam-eva kho, bhikkhave, tā bhikkhuniyo**  
just so, monks, those nuns

**Nandakassa Dhammadesanāya attamanā,**  
were uplifted by the venerable Nandaka's Dhamma preaching,

**ceva paripuṇṇasaṅkappā ca.**  
and their aspirations were fulfilled.

**Tāsaṃ, bhikkhave, pañcannaṃ bhikkhunīsatānaṃ**  
For those five hundred nuns, monks,

**yā pacchimā<sup>59</sup> bhikkhunī sā Sotāpannā,**  
the least nun is a Stream-Enterer,

**‘Sā Sotāpannā,’ ti yā sā guṇehi sabbapacchimikā, sā Sotāpannā.**  
‘A Stream-Enterer,’ the quality of the very least of all is a Stream-Enterer.

**Sesā pana Sakadāgāmi-Anāgāminiyo ca Khīṇāsavā ca.**  
The rest are Once-Returners, Non-Returners and those who Destroyed the Pollutants.

**Yadi evaṃ kathaṃ paripuṇṇasaṅkappā? ti**  
How are their aspirations said to be fulfilled?

**Ajjhāsayapāripūriyā.**  
Through the fulfilment of their intentions.

**Yassā hi bhikkhuniyā evam-ahosi:**  
To the nun that this (thought) occurred:

**‘Kadā nu kho ahaṃ ayyassa Nandakassa Dhammadesanaṃ suṇantī**  
‘When I am listening to the noble Nandaka's teaching of Dhamma

**tasmim yeva āsane Sotāpattiphalam sacchikareyyan,’-ti sā Sotāpattiphalam sacchākāsi.**  
on that very seat I can realise Stream-Entry,’ she did realise Stream-Entry.

**Yassā ahosi: “Sakadāgāmiphalaṃ Anāgāmiphalaṃ Arahattaṃ,”-ti**  
To her whom this (thought) occurred: ‘The fruit of Once-Returner, the fruit of Non-Returner and the fruit of the Destruction of the Pollutants,’

**sā Arahattaṃ sacchākāsi.**  
she realised Liberation.

**Tenāha Bhagavā: “Attamanā ceva paripuṇṇasaṅkappā cā.” ti**  
Therefore the Fortunate One said: “(They) were uplifted and their aspirations were fulfilled.”

---

<sup>59</sup> RTE, ChS: *pacchimikā*; alternative form.

**avinipātadhammā niyatā sambodhiparāyanā.”<sup>60</sup> ti**  
no longer subject to falling away, sure and destined for Full Awakening.”

**Idam-avoca Bhagavā,**  
The Fortunate One said this,

**attamanā te bhikkhū Bhagavato bhāsitaṃ abhinandun.-ti**  
and those monks were uplifted and greatly rejoiced in what was said by the Fortunate One.

*Nandakovādasuttaṃ Niṭṭhitaṃ<sup>61</sup>*  
*The Discourse giving Nandaka's Advice is Finished*

---

<sup>60</sup> BJT: *-parāyaṇā*; alternative form.

<sup>61</sup> BJT, PTS, ChS: *Nandakovādasuttaṃ Catutthaṃ*; RTE: *Nandakovādasuttaṃ Niṭṭhitaṃ Catutthaṃ*.

## Nandakattheravatthu

### The Story about the Elder Nandaka

AN 1.14.4.7  
(text)

**Etad-aggam̃ bhikkhave mama sāvakānam̃ bhikkhūnam̃,**  
This is the foremost of my monk disciples, monks,

**bhikkhunovādakānam̃, yad-idam̃, Nandako.**  
amongst those who advise the nuns, that is to say, Nandaka.

AA 1.14.4.7  
(commentary)

**Sattame, “Bhikkhunovādakānam̃, yad-idam̃, Nandako,”<sup>62</sup> ti**  
In the seventh (story), “Amongst those who advise the nuns, that is to say, Nandaka,”

**ayam̃ hi Thero Dhammakatham̃ kathento**  
while this Elder monk was giving a talk on Dhamma

**ekasamodhāne pañca bhikkhunīsātāni Arahattam̃ pāpesi.**  
altogether five hundred nuns attained Liberation.

**Tasmā bhikkhunovādakānam̃ aggo nāma jāto.**  
Therefore he became known as the foremost amongst those who advise the nuns.

**Tassa pañhakamme ayam-anupubbikathā:**  
This is the exposition concerning the enquiry into his (previous) deeds:

### His Aspiration and Good Deeds

**Ayam-pi hi<sup>63</sup> Padumuttarabuddhakāle,**  
At the time of the Buddha Padumuttara,

**Haṃsavatīnagare kulagehe<sup>64</sup> nibbatto,**  
he was reborn in a good family house in Haṃsavatī,

**Satthu Dhammadesanam̃<sup>65</sup> suṇanto,**  
and while listening to the Teacher’s teaching of the Dhamma,

---

<sup>62</sup> SHB omits: *yad-idam̃, Nandako*, reads: *Bhikkhunovādakānan-ti*.

<sup>63</sup> ChS: *Ayañ-hi*.

<sup>64</sup> SHB: *kulaghare*; different word, same meaning.

<sup>65</sup> SHB: *Dhammakatham̃*; different word, same meaning.



**Satthāraṃ ekaṃ bhikkhuṃ bhikkhunovādakānaṃ aggaṭṭhāne ṭhapentaṃ disvā,**  
he saw the Teacher set a certain monk aside as being foremost amongst those who advise  
the nuns,

**adhikāarakammaṃ katvā, taṃ ṭhānantaraṃ patthesi.**  
did a great deed, and aspired for that position himself.

### His Last Life

**So yāvajīvaṃ kusalaṃ katvā, devamanussesu saṃsaranto,**  
He did wholesome (deeds) for the rest of his life, and being reborn amongst gods and humans (only),

**imasmiṃ Buddhuppāde, Sāvattthiyaṃ kulagehe paṭisandhiṃ gahetvā,<sup>66</sup>**  
when this (Gotama) Buddha arose, after being conceived in a good family home in Sāvattthī,

**vayappatto Satthu Dhammadesanaṃ sutvā,**  
when he was mature he heard the Teacher teach the Dhamma,

**paṭiladdhasaddho Satthu santike pabbajitvā,**  
gained faith and went forth in the presence of the Teacher,

**vipassanaṃ vaḍḍhetvā Arahattaṃ pāpuṇitvā,<sup>67</sup>**  
developed insight and attained Liberation,

**pubbenivāsañāṇe ca ciṇṇavasī ahosi.**  
and became one who had mastered knowledge of his former lives.

**So catūsu parisāsu sampattāsu:**  
Within the four assemblies

**“Sabbesaṃ yeva manaṃ gahetvā kathetuṃ sakkotī,” ti**  
(it was said): “He was able to preach so as to capture everyone’s mind,”

**Dhammakathikanandako nāma jāto.**  
and he became known as Nandaka the Dhamma Preacher.

**Tathāgato pi kho Rohiṇīnadītīre cumbaṭakakalahe nikkhamitvā,**  
The Realised One departed from the string of quarrels on the bank of the River Rohiṇī,

**pabbajitānaṃ pañcannaṃ Sākiyakumārasatānaṃ anabhiratiyā uppanāya,**  
and discontent having arisen for the five hundred Sākiyan Princes who went forth,

**te bhikkhū ādāya Kuṇāladahaṃ gantvā,**  
he took those monks and went to the Kuṇāla Lake,

---

<sup>66</sup> SHB: *gaṇhitvā*; different word, same meaning.

<sup>67</sup> ChS: *pāpuṇi*; but the sentence hasn’t ended, and we wouldn’t expect a finite verb yet.

**Kuṇālaajātakakathāya nesam samviggabhāvam ñatvā,**  
and understanding their spiritual anxiety because of the talk on the Kuṇāla Birth Story,

**Catusaccakatham kathetvā, Sotāpattiphale patitṭhāpesi.**  
and preaching a talk on the Four Truths, he established them in the fruit of Stream-Entry.

**Aparabhāge Mahāsamayasuttam kathetvā aggaphalam Arahattam pāpesi.**  
Later he preached the Discourse on the Great Assembly and made them attain the supreme fruit of Liberation.

**Tesam Therānam purāṇadutiyaikā:**  
Those Elders' former wives

**“Amhe dāni idha kim karissāmā?” ti vatvā,**  
saying: “What do we have to do here now?”

**sabbā va ekacittā hutvā, Mahāpajāpatim upasaṅkamtivā, pabbajjam yācimsu.**  
had but one thought, and after approaching Mahāpajāpatī they requested the going forth.

**Tā<sup>68</sup> pañcasatā pi Theriyā santike pabbajjañ-ca upasampadañ-ca labhimsu.**  
In the presence of that Elder nun all five hundred received the going forth and the higher ordination.

### His Past Life

**Atītānantarāya pana jātiyā**  
In his immediately past life

**sabbā va tā Nandakatherassa<sup>69</sup> Rājaputtabhāve<sup>70</sup> ṭhitassa pādapariārikā ahesum.**  
they all had been the wives of the Elder Nandaka when he was a Prince.

**Tena समयena Satthā: “Bhikkhū bhikkhuniyo ovađantū,” ti āha.**  
At that time the Teacher said: “Monks must advise the nuns.”

**Thero attano vāre sampatte,**  
When the Elder's turn arrived,

**tāsam purimabhāve attano pādapariārikabhāvam ñatvā cintesi:**  
knowing they were his wives in a previous existence he thought:

---

<sup>68</sup> ChS adds: *pi*.

<sup>69</sup> ChS: *Nandakattherassa*; showing gemination.

<sup>70</sup> SHB: *Rājattabhāve*; perhaps would mean: *during his Kingship*.

**‘Maṃ imassa Bhikkhunīsaṅghassa majjhe nisinnaṃ**  
‘Sitting in the midst of this Community of nuns

**upamāyo ca kāraṇāni ca āharitvā,**  
and bringing forward similes and reasons,

**Dhammaṃ kathayamānaṃ disvā,**  
and being seen preaching the Dhamma,

**añño pubbenivāsaññalābhī bhikkhu imaṃ kāraṇaṃ oloketvā,**  
(if) another monk who also had knowledge of previous lives looked at the reason for it,

**‘Āyasmā Nandako yāvajjadvāsā orodhe na vissajjeti,**  
° he might think he could say: “Venerable Nandaka up to this day did not send off his concubines,

**sobhatāyasmā<sup>71</sup> orodhaparivuto,” ti vattabbaṃ maññeyyā.’ ti**  
this venerable is resplendent when surrounded by his concubines.”

**Tasmā sayam agantvā aññaṃ bhikkhuṃ pesesi.**  
Therefore when it came to his (turn) he sent another monk.

### Teaching the Nuns

**Tā pana pañcasatā bhikkhuniyo Therasseva ovādaṃ paccāsimsanti.<sup>72</sup>**  
But those five hundred nuns desired the Elder’s advice.

**Iminā kāraṇena Bhagavā**  
For this reason the Fortunate One

**‘Attano vāre sampatte, aññaṃ apesetvā,**  
° said to the Elder monk: “When your turn arrives, without sending another,

**sayam-eva gantvā, Bhikkhunīsaṅghaṃ ovadāhī,” ti Theram āha.**  
having gone yourself, advise the Community of nuns.”

**So Satthu kathaṃ paṭibāhituṃ asakkonto,**  
He was unable to refuse the Teacher’s speech,

**attano vāre sampatte cātuddase bhikkhunīsaṅghassa ovādaṃ datvā,**  
and when his turn arrived on the fourteenth he gave advice to the Community of nuns,

**sabbā va tā bhikkhuniyo saḷāyatanapaṭimaṇḍitāya**  
° and with a Dhamma teaching elaborating on the six sense spheres

---

<sup>71</sup> ChS: *sobhatāyam-āyasmā*; locative form.

<sup>72</sup> ChS: *paccāsīsanti*; alternative form.

**Dhammadesanāya Sotāpattiphale paṭiṭṭhāpesi.**

he established all the nuns in the fruit of Stream-Entry.

**Tā bhikkhuniyo, Therassa Dhammadesanāya attamanā hutvā,**

Those nuns, being uplifted by the Elder's Dhamma teaching,

**Satthu santikaṃ gantvā attano<sup>73</sup> paṭividdhagaṇaṃ ārocesuṃ.**

went into the presence of the Teacher and informed him of their penetration (of the Dhamma).

**Satthā: 'Kasmiṃ nu kho Dhammaṃ desente**

The Teacher thought: 'With what Dhamma teaching

**imā bhikkhuniyo uparimaggaphalāni pāpuṇeyyūn,'-ti**

will these nuns attain the further Paths and Fruits?'

**āvajjento: 'Puna taṃ yeva Nandakassa Dhammadesanaṃ sutvā**

and reflecting further: 'Listening again to Nandaka's Dhamma teaching surely

**pañcasatā pi etā Arahattaṃ pāpuṇissanti.' ti**

these five hundred will attain Liberation.'

**Disvā, punadivase pi Therasseva santikaṃ Dhammasavaṇatthāya<sup>74</sup> pesesi,**

Having seen (that), on another day he sent them into the Elder's presence to listen to the Dhamma,

**tā punadivase Dhammaṃ sutvā sabbā va Arahattaṃ pattā.**

and on that day they listened to Dhamma and attained Liberation.

**Taṃdivasaṃ Bhagavā tāsāṃ bhikkhunīnaṃ attano santikaṃ āgatakāle,**

On that day the Fortunate One came into the presence of those nuns,

**Dhammadesanāya saphalabhāvaṃ ñatvā,**

he understood (they had attained) the fruition state with that Dhamma teaching,

**"Bhiyyo<sup>75</sup> Nandakassa Dhammadesanā cātuddasiyaṃ candasadisī ahoṣi,**

and he said: "Nandaka's Dhamma teaching yesterday, was like the moon on the fourteenth day,

**ajja pannarasiyaṃ candasadisī," ti vatvā**

today it is like the moon on the fifteenth day,"

---

<sup>73</sup> SHB: *attanā*; instrumental, when genitive is needed.

<sup>74</sup> ChS: *Dhammassavanatthāya*; showing gemination.

<sup>75</sup> ChS: *Hiyyo*; alternative form.

**Therassa sādhuḱāraṃ datvā, tad-eva ca kāraṇaṃ aṭṭhuppattiṃ katvā,**<sup>76</sup>  
and having given his approval to the Elder monk, for that reason as the occasion had  
arisen,

**Theraṃ bhikkhunovādakānaṃ aggaṭṭhāne ṭhapesī. ti**  
he placed this Elder monk in the foremost position amongst those who advise the nuns.

---

<sup>76</sup> SHB omits: *tad-eva ca kāraṇaṃ aṭṭhuppattiṃ katvā.*